



Mujahid Hamdan <abd.mujahid.hamdan@gmail.com>

EMAS-D-21-01763 - Submission Confirmation

1 pesan

EMAS <em@editorialmanager.com>

26 April 2021 pukul 11.10

Balas Ke: "EMAS <" <rheycel.monsanto@springernature.com>

Kepada: Abd Mujahid <abd.mujahid.hamdan@gmail.com>

CC: "Satria Bijaksana" satria@fi.itb.ac.id, "Fathul Hakim" fathulhakim007@gmail.com, "Muhammad Iksan" al.1iksaan@gmail.com, "Mulyadi Abdul Wahid" mul98.psy@googlemail.com, "Mariyanto Mariyanto" mariyanto.f27@gmail.com, "Kartika Hajar Kirana" kartika@geophys.unpad.ac.id, "Teuku Muhammad Ashari" t.m.ashari@gmail.com, "Hadi Kurniawan" hadik@ar-raniry.ac.id, "Aditya Pratama" pratama.itb@gmail.com, "La Ode Nkoimani" laodem@yahoo.com

Dear Dr Mujahid,

Thank you for submitting your manuscript, "Magnetic Susceptibility of Surface Sediments from Estuary River in Volcanic Region", to Environmental Monitoring and Assessment

The submission id is: EMAS-D-21-01763

Please refer to this number in any future correspondence.

As soon as the reviewer comments are completed and an editorial decision has been reached, the editor will correspond with you directly.

During the review process, you can keep track of the status of your manuscript.

Your username is: Mujahid

If you forgot your password, you can click the 'Send Login Details' link on the EM Login page at <https://www.editorialmanager.com/emas/>.

If your manuscript is accepted for publication in Environmental Monitoring and Assessment, you may elect to submit it to the Open Choice program. For information about the Open Choice program, please access the following URL: <http://www.springer.com/openchoice>

Thank you.

With kind regards,
Editorial Office EMAS
Springer

Now that your article will undergo the editorial and peer review process, it is the right time to think about publishing your article as open access. With open access your article will become freely available to anyone worldwide and you will easily comply with open access mandates. Springer's open access offering for this journal is called Open Choice (find more information on www.springer.com/openchoice). Once your article is accepted, you will be offered the option to publish through open access. So you might want to talk to your institution and funder now to see how payment could be organized; for an overview of available open access funding please go to www.springer.com/oafunding. Although for now you don't have to do anything, we would like to let you know about your upcoming options.

****Our flexible approach during the COVID-19 pandemic****

If you need more time at any stage of the peer-review process, please do let us know. While our systems will continue to remind you of the original timelines, we aim to be as flexible as possible during the current pandemic.

This letter contains confidential information, is for your own use, and should not be forwarded to third parties.

Recipients of this email are registered users within the Editorial Manager database for this journal. We will keep your information on file to use in the process of submitting, evaluating and publishing a manuscript. For more information on how we use your personal details please see our privacy policy at <https://www.springernature.com/production->

[privacy-policy](#). If you no longer wish to receive messages from this journal or you have questions regarding database management, please contact the Publication Office at the link below.

In compliance with data protection regulations, you may request that we remove your personal registration details at any time. (Use the following URL: <https://www.editorialmanager.com/emas/login.asp?a=r>). Please contact the publication office if you have any questions.



Mujahid Hamdan <abd.mujahid.hamdan@gmail.com>

Major Revisions requested EMAS-D-21-01763

1 pesan

EMAS <em@editorialmanager.com>

25 Juni 2021 pukul 13.50

Balas Ke: "EMAS <" <rheycel.monsanto@springernature.com>

Kepada: Abd Mujahid <abd.mujahid.hamdan@gmail.com>

Dear Dr Mujahid,

We have received the reports from our advisors on your manuscript, "Magnetic Susceptibility of Surface Sediments from Estuary River in Volcanic Region", which you submitted to Environmental Monitoring and Assessment.

Based on the advice received, I feel that your manuscript could be reconsidered for publication should you be prepared to incorporate major revisions.

When preparing your revised manuscript, you are asked to carefully consider the reviewer comments below, and submit a list of responses to the comments.

You are kindly requested to also check the website for possible reviewer attachment(s).

You will need to log in to the journal and check the submission details as described below.

Your username is: Mujahid

If you forgot your password, you can click the 'Send Login Details' link on the EM Login page at <https://www.editorialmanager.com/emas/>.

To submit your revision, please login as author and click the Submissions Needing Revision link.

Also, please make sure to submit your editable source files (i. e. Word, TeX).

We look forward to receiving your revised manuscript before 17 Sep 2021

With kind regards,
Mrs. Maria Vicenta Esteller
Associate Editor

There is additional documentation related to this decision letter. To access the file(s), please click the link below. You may also login to the system and click the 'View Attachments' link in the Action column.

<https://www.editorialmanager.com/emas/l.asp?i=873413&l=7IKIQIOV>

COMMENTS FOR THE AUTHOR:

Reviewer #1: Although the manuscript contains a lot of information indicating great effort, however, there are some notes that are presented below.

- 1- There are some English language problems that must be addressed before the publication. Also, There are many typing and grammar mistakes in addition to phrase construction are not of publishable quality
- 2- When were the samples collected (the sampling time)?
- 3- Table 1 or fig. 2 must be deleted.
- 4- The caption of tables and figures should be modified and simplified, for ex. " Table 1. Metal concentrations in the sediment samples from the Krueng Aceh River" detection limit."
- 5- Please revise the conservative and non-conservative behaviour of metals and correct the sentences " Based on the effect of salinity,) Page 10 lines 181-185.
- 6- The figures must be clarified in high resolution
- 7- I suggest that the authors add the characterization of water of the sampling site to give a clear picture of the study area.
- 8- Statistics of data must be mentioned

Reviewer #2: Comments added to the original PDF files

Please note that this journal is a Transformative Journal (TJ). Authors may publish their research with us through the traditional subscription access route or make their paper immediately open access through payment of an article-processing charge (APC). Authors will not be required to make a final decision about access to their article until it has been accepted.

Authors may need to take specific actions to achieve compliance with funder and institutional open access mandates. If your research is supported by a funder that requires immediate open access (e.g. according to Plan S principles) then you should select the gold OA route, and we will direct you to the compliant route where possible. For authors selecting the subscription publication route our standard licensing terms will need to be accepted, including our self-archiving policies. Those standard licensing terms will supersede any other terms that the author or any third party may assert apply to any version of the manuscript.

<https://www.springernature.com/gp/open-research/funding/policy-compliance-faqs> Find out more about compliance

****Our flexible approach during the COVID-19 pandemic****

If you need more time at any stage of the peer-review process, please do let us know. While our systems will continue to remind you of the original timelines, we aim to be as flexible as possible during the current pandemic.

This letter contains confidential information, is for your own use, and should not be forwarded to third parties.

Recipients of this email are registered users within the Editorial Manager database for this journal. We will keep your information on file to use in the process of submitting, evaluating and publishing a manuscript. For more information on how we use your personal details please see our privacy policy at <https://www.springernature.com/production-privacy-policy>. If you no longer wish to receive messages from this journal or you have questions regarding database management, please contact the Publication Office at the link below.

In compliance with data protection regulations, you may request that we remove your personal registration details at any time. (Use the following URL: <https://www.editorialmanager.com/emas/login.asp?a=r>). Please contact the publication office if you have any questions.



Mujahid Hamdan <abd.mujahid.hamdan@gmail.com>

Submission Confirmation

1 pesan

Environmental Monitoring and Assessment <<em@editorialmanager.com> 29 November 2021 pukul 20.38
Balas Ke: "Environmental Monitoring and Assessment <" <rheycel.monsanto@springer.com>
Kepada: Abd Mujahid <abd.mujahid.hamdan@gmail.com>

Dear Dr Mujahid,

We acknowledge, with thanks, receipt of the revised version of your manuscript, "Magnetic Susceptibilities of Surface Sediments from Estuary Rivers in Volcanic Regions", submitted to Environmental Monitoring and Assessment

The manuscript number is EMAS-D-21-01763R3.

You will need to log in to the journal and check the submission details as described below.

Your username is: Mujahid

If you forgot your password, you can click the 'Send Login Details' link on the EM Login page at <https://www.editorialmanager.com/emas/>.

We will inform you of the Editor's decision as soon as possible.

With best regards,

Editorial Office

Springer

P.O. Box 990

3300 AZ DORDRECHT

The Netherlands

This letter contains confidential information, is for your own use, and should not be forwarded to third parties.

Recipients of this email are registered users within the Editorial Manager database for this journal. We will keep your information on file to use in the process of submitting, evaluating and publishing a manuscript. For more information on how we use your personal details please see our privacy policy at <https://www.springernature.com/production-privacy-policy>. If you no longer wish to receive messages from this journal or you have questions regarding database management, please contact the Publication Office at the link below.

In compliance with data protection regulations, you may request that we remove your personal registration details at any time. (Use the following URL: <https://www.editorialmanager.com/emas/login.asp?a=r>). Please contact the publication office if you have any questions.



Mujahid Hamdan <abd.mujahid.hamdan@gmail.com>

Your Submission EMAS-D-21-01763R21 pesan

Environmental Monitoring and Assessment <em@editorialmanager.com> 23 November 2021 pukul 12.01
Balas Ke: "Environmental Monitoring and Assessment <" <rheycel.monsanto@springer.com>
Kepada: Abd Mujahid <abd.mujahid.hamdan@gmail.com>

Dear Dr Mujahid,

We have received the reports from our advisors on your manuscript, "Magnetic Susceptibilities of Surface Sediments from Estuary Rivers in Volcanic Regions", submitted to Environmental Monitoring and Assessment

Based on the advice received, I have decided that your manuscript can be accepted for publication after you have carried out the corrections as suggested by the reviewer(s).

Please find the reviewers' comments below for your perusal.

You are kindly requested to also check the website for possible reviewer attachment(s).

You will need to log in to the journal and check the submission details as described below

Your username is: Mujahid

If you forgot your password, you can click the 'Send Login Details' link on the EM Login page at <https://www.editorialmanager.com/emas/>.

To submit your revision, please login as author and click the Submissions Needing Revision link.

Also, please make sure to submit your editable source files (i. e. Word, TeX).

I am looking forward to receiving your revised manuscript before 25 Jan 2022

With kind regards,
Mrs. Maria Vicenta Esteller
Associate Editor

Comments for the Author:

Reviewer #3: An introduction is informative and well presented. Study area characteristics are well described. Material and methods section is described at the satisfactory level. Results are presented in clear and concise way, although no comparison with other studies is presented in this section, so the context is missing. Discussion - metals concentration and magnetic properties are well discussed and attributed to physical processes. The hypotheses are well documented by results. Figure 5 is presenting the results on the scale of distance, however in discussion sampling stations are a reference point. In my opinion, sampling stations should be marked at figure 5 for clarity.

Reviewer #4: This paper discusses the usefulness of Magnetic susceptibility as a proxy indicator for identifying the Estuary turbidity maxima (ETM) zones where heavy metal enrichment is expected to occur (due to accumulation of sediments which contain magnetic minerals). The study site used was the estuarine region of Krueng Aceh river, Indonesia where minimal anthropogenic pollution of heavy metals is expected. The study includes measurements of Magnetic susceptibility along with chemical and mineralogical analysis in the Discussions part.

The discussions part is elaborate and investigates the relationship between magnetic susceptibility and geochemistry of sediments in the ETM zone. The authors mention that, for the first time, χ_{LF} / χ_{FD} i.e., low frequency magnetic susceptibility/frequency-dependent magnetic susceptibility has been proposed as a proxy for ETM zone identification.

A few clarifications are needed:

- 1) Lines 116-117: 'Bn is the point with no metal enrichment process....activity'. Where was sampling point Bn taken from? Could it be shown in the Sampling map in Figure 1?
- 2) Table 1: Statistical figures (Min, Max, Average & standard deviation) have been calculated for XRF measurements presumably based on previous reviewer's comments. It would be more useful to provide the standard deviation value for each element at each sampling point (rather than calculate the standard deviations for an entire column). Was only a single measurement taken at each sampling point? If so, what is the confidence level in the single value measured?
- 3) Table 3: Again, statistical figures (Min, Max, Average & standard deviation) have been calculated for all magnetic susceptibility measurements across all sampling points. I don't see much point in this. Instead, what adds value is to include the standard deviation value for each measurement, similar to the value 248.6 ± 7.6 shown in the table for χ_{HF} against sample code 7 (which shows the confidence level in each measurement).

Typos & other minor suggestions:

- 1) Line 129: '....except at point with Ti'. There is no concentration value in Table 1 for Ti. Should it read Cr instead?
- 2) Figure 2 is being referred to in lines 168, 206 & 216. In the current version, Figure 2 is XRD diffractogram of sample point 8. It appears that Figure 2 from the original version of the manuscript has been deleted. Please correct this throughout the text.
- 3) Line 198: Based on Figure 4 presented, Fe and Mn are not showing any significant positive correlation with Ca as mentioned in the text. Please check this.
- 4) Lines 263, 264: Should it not be Figure 6 instead of Table 3?
- 5) Line 291: Pearson correlation matrix is presented in Table 4 instead of Table 3. Please correct.
- 6) Lines 293-295: 'Based on Figure 7were not significant'. While this is true, correlation between χ_{FD} and Al is also showing a positive correlation. Perhaps Al can also be included?

Please note that this journal is a Transformative Journal (TJ). Authors may publish their research with us through the traditional subscription access route or make their paper immediately open access through payment of an article-processing charge (APC). Authors will not be required to make a final decision about access to their article until it has been accepted.

Authors may need to take specific actions to achieve compliance with funder and institutional open access mandates. If your research is supported by a funder that requires immediate open access (e.g. according to Plan S principles) then you should select the gold OA route, and we will direct you to the compliant route where possible. For authors selecting the subscription publication route our standard licensing terms will need to be accepted, including our self-archiving policies. Those standard licensing terms will supersede any other terms that the author or any third party may assert apply to any version of the manuscript.

<https://www.springernature.com/gp/open-research/funding/policy-compliance-faqs> Find out more about compliance

This letter contains confidential information, is for your own use, and should not be forwarded to third parties.

Recipients of this email are registered users within the Editorial Manager database for this journal. We will keep your information on file to use in the process of submitting, evaluating and publishing a manuscript. For more information on how we use your personal details please see our privacy policy at <https://www.springernature.com/production-privacy-policy>. If you no longer wish to receive messages from this journal or you have questions regarding database management, please contact the Publication Office at the link below.

In compliance with data protection regulations, you may request that we remove your personal registration details at any time. (Use the following URL: <https://www.editorialmanager.com/emas/login.asp?a=r>). Please contact the publication office if you have any questions.



Mujahid Hamdan <abd.mujahid.hamdan@gmail.com>

Your Submission EMAS-D-21-01763R3 - [EMID:c67a3b60e3c81a48]1 pesan

Environmental Monitoring and Assessment <em@editorialmanager.com>

29 Januari 2022 pukul 22.14

Balas Ke: Environmental Monitoring and Assessment <rheycel.monsanto@springer.com>

Kepada: Abd Mujahid <abd.mujahid.hamdan@gmail.com>

Dear Dr Mujahid,

We are pleased to inform you that your manuscript, "Magnetic Susceptibilities of Surface Sediments from Estuary Rivers in Volcanic Regions", has been accepted for publication in Environmental Monitoring and Assessment.

You will be contacted by Author Services in due course with a link to complete the grant of rights. Please note that you will receive your proofs after the publishing agreement has been received through our system.

Please remember to quote the manuscript number, EMAS-D-21-01763R3, whenever inquiring about your manuscript.

Thank you.

With best regards,
Journals Editorial Office
Springer

Reviewer #3: The manuscript was improved according to reviewer's comments. Sections that were satisfactory at the time of first review are still good (Introduction, Material and Methods), while sections that needed to be improve (Results, discussion) are now rewritten in a way that makes them easier to follow and understand. Overall, the manuscript presents well documented research, with satisfactory explanation of observed processes. It presents several ways of utilization of magnetic susceptibility in studying estuarine sediments. Job well done!

Reviewer #4: The authors have incorporated all corrections recommended. One minor correction is required- in Lines 196-197- Lines 196-197- "Furthermore, the concentrations of Fe and Mn.....and a positive correlation with Ca level." Please change this to a "negative" correlation with Ca level (based on Figure 4).

Please note that this journal is a Transformative Journal (TJ). Authors may publish their research with us through the traditional subscription access route or make their paper immediately open access through payment of an article-processing charge (APC). Authors will not be required to make a final decision about access to their article until it has been accepted.

Authors may need to take specific actions to achieve compliance with funder and institutional open access mandates. If your research is supported by a funder that requires immediate open access (e.g. according to Plan S principles) then you should select the gold OA route, and we will direct you to the compliant route where possible. For authors selecting the subscription publication route our standard licensing terms will need to be accepted, including our self-archiving policies. Those standard licensing terms will supersede any other terms that the author or any third party may assert apply to any version of the manuscript.

<a href= <https://www.springernature.com/gp/open-research/funding/policy-compliance-faqs>> Find out more about compliance

This letter contains confidential information, is for your own use, and should not be forwarded to third parties.

Recipients of this email are registered users within the Editorial Manager database for this journal. We will keep your information on file to use in the process of submitting, evaluating and publishing a manuscript. For more information on how we use your personal details please see our privacy policy at <https://www.springernature.com/production->

[privacy-policy](#). If you no longer wish to receive messages from this journal or you have questions regarding database management, please contact the Publication Office at the link below.

In compliance with data protection regulations, you may request that we remove your personal registration details at any time. (Use the following URL: <https://www.editorialmanager.com/emas/login.asp?a=r>). Please contact the publication office if you have any questions.