AN ANALYSIS ON STUDENTS' ERRORS AND DIFFICULTIES

IN USING RELATIVE CLAUSE

(A Descriptive Study at Universitas Islam Negeri Ar-Raniry, Banda Aceh)

THESIS

Submitted by

Satria Zulkarnein

Department of English Language Education Faculty of Education and Teacher Training

Reg. No. 231222739



FACULTY OF EDUCATION AND TEACHER TRAINING AR-RANIRY STATE ISLAMIC UNIVERSITY DARUSSALAM-BANDA ACEH 2016 M/ 1437 H

THESIS

Submitted to Faculty of Education and Teacher Training of UIN Ar-Raniry Darussalam Banda Aceh as a partial fulfillment of the requirements for Sarjana Degree (S-1) on Teacher Education

By:

SATRIA ZULKARNEIN The Student of English Education Department Faculty of Education and Teacher Training Reg. No. 231222739

Approved by:

Vlain Supervisor elistil.

(Drs. Luthfi Aunie, MA)

Co Supervisor (Ika Kana Trisnawati M.Ed)

i

It has been defended in Sidang Munaqasyah in front of the council of Examiners for Working Paper and has been accepted in Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements for Sarjana Degree S-1 on Teacher Education

On:

Friday, <u>August 19th, 2016</u> Dzulqaidah 15th, 1437 H

Darussalam – Banda Aceh

Chairperson,

Syamsul Bahri, MA TESOL

Secretary,

Almuntarizi, S.Pd. I

Member,

Ika Kana Trisnawati, MA., M.Ed

Member,

Khairiah Syahabuddin, MHSc. ESL., M.TESOL

Certified by:

The Dean of Faculty of Tarbiyah and Taecher Training Universitas Islam Negeri Ar-Raniry

> Dr. Mujiburrahman, M.Ag NIP. 19710908 2001121 001

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

لللهِ الرَّجْمُزَ إلرَّجْمُزُ إلرَّجْمَنُ

Alhamdulillah, all praises be to Allah the Almighty, Who has given strength and true spirit to the writer, so this thesis "An Analysis on Students' Errors and Difficulties in Using Relative Clause (A Descriptive Study at Universitas Islam Negeri Ar-Raniry, Banda Aceh)" could be completed. *Shalawat and salam* to the Prophet Muhammad SAW, peace be upon him, who has shown us the right of Islam so we can live happily on the earth and on the hereafter.

The writer realizes that he would never finish writing this paper without the help of some people around him; therefore, he would like to give special thanks to her beloved parents Mr. Zulhusaini IA, A.Md and Mrs. Nurbaidah, who always pray and support him in every part of his life especially in finishing this paper. His deep thank is also given to his brother and sister Zemi Alkhalid, S.Pd, Zelfiana Rahmi, A.Md and Oka Putri who always help, support and motivate him in finishing this paper.

The writer would like addres her gratitude to his main supervisor, Mr. Drs. Luthfi Aunie MA and his co-supervisor Ika Kana Trisnawati, MA., M.Ed for the time, guidance, kindness and patience in correcting and helping him in finishing this paper. He also dedicated his deepest gratitude to his academic supervisor, Mrs. Siti Khasinah, M.Pd who has guided and encouraged him from the first semester until the end.

Furthermore, unforgettable thanks are presented to my classmate, the students of English department in academic year 2012 especially unit 4 for the support, kindness and motivation.

Finally, I believed that this thesis was far from the perfection. Therefore, corrections and suggestions from the reader are invited to make this study will be better.

Banda Aceh, August 8th 2016

Satria Zulkarnein

TABLE OF CONTENTS

DECLARATION LETTER	i
ABSTRACT	ii
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	iii
TABLE OF CONTENTS	iv
LIST OF TABLES	v
LIST OF APPENDICES	vi

CHAPTER I : INTRODUCTION

A. Background of Study	1
B. Research Question.	4
C. Aim of Study	4
D. Significance of Study	
E. Terminologies	5
F. Previous Study	7

CHAPTER II : LITERATURE REVIEW

A. Gr	ammar	
1.	Definition of Grammar	
2.	The Role of Grammar	9
B. Cl	ause	9
	Definition of Clause	
2.	The Types of Clause	
	elative Clause	
1.	Definition of Relative Clause	
2.	The Types of Relative Clause	
	The Usage of Relative Clause	
	The Difficulties of Relative Clause	
D. Er	ror	
	Definition of Error	
	The Source of Error	
3.	Error Analysis	

CHAPTER III : RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

A. Research Design	. 21
B. Population and Sample	
C. Techniques of Data Collection	
D. Techniques Data Analysis	. 23

CHAPTER IV : RESEARCH FINDING AND DISCUSSION

A Research	Finding	2	5	5
11. 1000001011	1 11101118		-	ſ

1.	The Result of The Test	25
2.	The Result of Interview	47
B. Di	scussion	60

CHAPTER V : CONCLUSIONS AND SUGGESTIONS A. Conclusions.....

A. Conclusions	64
B. Suggestions	65

BIBLIOGRPHY APPENDICES AUTOBIOGRAPHY

ABSTRACT

This study analyzed students' errors on using relative clause. The purposes of the study were to find out the errors made by the EFL students in using relative clauses and to figure out what makes the EFL students do errors. The research design in this study was descriptive research. To this end, I used simple random sampling to choose the sample of the research. 20 students of 8th semester of English department at UIN Ar-Raniry were chosen as the sample of this research. To answer the first research question, the paper test was distributed to the students to find out the errors that they made. In addition, to answer second research question, semi-structured interview was employed. Finally, 8 students who got most errors were chosen to participate in interview that focused on the causes at their errors. The results of this research showed that the students got most of the errors on relative clause "whose" with 88.75 % of the average error and on the relative clause "whom" with 60%. In brief, there were some factors that cause students made errors, namely the confusion in using relative clause, overemphasis on language forms, lacking in vocabulary mastery and language transfer problem.

CHAPTER I

INTRODUCTION

A. Background of Study

In learning grammar, a clause is a part that occurs frequently in the English book such as textbooks. A clause may be defined in the same way as a sentence it contains subject and verb. Azar (1993, p.267) said "a clause is a set of words which contains subject and verb". Generally, a clause is divided by two kinds, namely independent and dependent. As Downing (1995) stated an independent clause is complete in itself, whereas dependent clause is necessarily related to an independent clause. In short, we can define that the independent clause is a clause that may stands alone as a sentence while the dependent clause cannot stand alone because it has a special introductory word that makes the predication depends on an independent clause.

In English grammar, one of clauses that important to be learnt is relative clause. According to Frank (1990, as cited in Anggraini, 2008) stated that "the relative clause modifies a preceding noun or a pronoun". In Addition, Azar (2002, p.267) said that "a relative clause is a dependent clause that modifies a noun; it describes, identifies, or gives further information about noun".

Relative clause is an essential item to understand because it concerns to a clause or sentence that plays an important role in a language. Therefore, by

understanding it, the students can produce a complex sentence and understand about the sentence. Furthermore, the relative clause is frequently used in the English text book, magazine, newspaper and the other English written forms. Hence, if students understand about it well, they can avoid the misunderstanding about the sentence that they read. Azar (2002, p.129) stated "the student who can employ relative clause in dependent clauses can greatly increase their communicative competence in the language."

In the fact that is not all students are able to master the rules of relative clause easily. Based on the researcher's past experience, sometimes there were some difficulties and confusion in learning relative clause. In addition, the researcher observed that sometimes there were some students who have difficulties on relative clauses and make some errors. Sometimes students do not know how to use the relative clause even the students often make some errors in implementing relative clause rules. Especially for EFL learners, the students sometimes misinterpreted the grammatical system of their own mother tongue with the target language which is learnt. It also can be seen from the information of the lectures who teach the relative clause at UIN Ar-Raniry, Banda Aceh which is obtained from the document of students' relative clause test showed that the students made some errors in using relative clause.

The errors which are made by the EFL students in implementing relative clause rules might caused by the differences between their own mother tongue and the target language which is learnt. In this case is the use of English relative clause and Indonesia relative clause. According to Azar (2002) in English, there are many types of relative clause and they also have different function and usage. First, for person, relative clause that used are "who", "whom", "whose" or "that". "Who" refers to subject; "whom" as object; "whose" as possessive adjective, and "that" as subject or object. Next, for a thing used "which" or "that" and both relative clauses has function as subject or object. Meanwhile, according to Ewing (1998) a standard Indonesian relative clause is introduced by the marker "yang". The marker yang is used in any position in all sentences and does not change; so that it may makes the students are confused to use English grammar.

The difficulties of students in learning relative clause sometimes cause errors. Acoording to Corder (1981) stated "an error is the result of behavior failure". Errors can be defined as the evidence about the nature of the process, the rules and categories that are used by the learners at a certain stage in the course.

In learning a language, the study of learner's errors is needed because the result of the study gives some contributions on attempting the students' difficulties. Corder (1981) stated that errors of the learners are important because those are give a reflection to teachers to know what they should teach and how to teach. Through analyzing the errors systematically, the teacher will know what level students have reached; how much students approach to the target language; what students should continue to learn and what strategies and steps should students take in their learning process. Learner can know their weaknesses through analyzing and correcting their errors. All in all, errors reveal the process of language learning and as the result, it

helps the teacher to infer the nature of the students' knowledge and find what they should have to learn by analyzing the students' errors.

Regarding the explanation mention previously, the writer wants to conduct a study with a title "An Analysis of Students' Errors and Difficulties in Using Relative Clause (A Descriptive Study at Universitas Islam Negeri Ar-Raniry, Banda Aceh)".

B. Research Question

Based on the background of the study above, the researcher formulates the following research questions:

1. What are the errors made by the students of UIN Ar-Raniry in using relative clauses?

2. Why do the students of UIN Ar-Raniry make the errors?

C. The Aim of Study

Based on the statement of the problem above, the objectives of the study are following:

1. To find out the errors made by the EFL students in using relative clause.

2. To figure out what makes the EFL students do error.

D. The Significance of Study

1. Lecturers

The result of this study will give lecturers clear information about the factors of students' errors in using relative clauses. Therefore, they will be able to find a proper method to decrease the students' errors in using relative clauses.

2. Students

Through this research, the researcher hopes that it will give a general view of the extent of the students' ability in understanding the relative clauses. The writer also hopes the result of this research can be a self-reflection for the students to be better in the future, especially related to the use of relative clauses.

3. Further Research

For further research it can be used more on the continuation of this grammar. Hence, it is hoped that the research can help the future researchers to obtain the information for the study being investigated.

E. Terminologies

To provide a better understanding of the study, the operational definitions of the following terms are employed:

1. Error vs Mistake

In learning second language, the learners sometime make errors and mistakes whether it is in speaking or writing. There are many people who still have opinion that error and mistake are the same. Actually, error and mistake are different.

Dulay (1982) stated that error is the flawed side of learner speech or writing. Those are part of conversation or composition that deviates from some selected mature language performance. Error on this study focuses on the students' error on using relative clause.

According to Tarigan (1995), mistake is caused by performance factor. It is caused by misjudgment, carelessness, forgetfulness. Mistake can happen in every linguistic level. Mistake usually can be corrected by the students itself if more attention were given.

1. Difficulty

According to merriam-webster dictionary (merriam-webster.com, 2016) the word difficulty is something that is not easy to do or to deal with a difficult situation.

Based on the definition, the researcher concludes that *difficulty* is any condition that a student finds not easy to understand or to deal with in the target language rules.

2. Relative Clause

Azar (2002, p.267) stated that "relative clause is a dependent clause that modifies a noun". It describes or gives further information about noun.

F. Previous Studies

Other similar studies related to relative clauses were conducted by Ahmad Syarif (2011) and Musonah (2014).

Musonah in her research *An Analysis on Students' Error in Using Relative Pronoun* (2014), tried to find out whether the students made errors in using relative pronoun in adjective clause in second year of SMA Negeri Fatahillah, Jakarta Selatan. She used qualitative research and the instruments of the research were written test and interview. Finding showed that most of error made by the students was in relative pronoun *whose* with the highest percentage of 39.75%. As for the type of error, most students made the error in *misselection* with 70.94%, *omission* 20.9%, and *addition 8.97%*. The second study is by Ahmad Syarif *An Analysis of Student's Errors in Using Adjective Clause* (2011) which was conducted on the second year students of MAN 4 Cijeruk Bogor. The objectives of the study were to know the students' errors in using adjective clauses and to know why the students faced difficulties in using the adjective clauses. The analysis used was descriptive method. Syarif found that most students made error on *whom* with the average error of 82.80%. On the other hand, the least frequent error was *who* with the average of 30.11%.

CHAPTER II

LITERATURE REVIEW

A. Grammar

1. The Definition of Grammar

Grammar is one of the important studies that have to be mastered by any students who learn language. Batstone (1994, p 136) as cited in Sukalim (2009, p.5) defined grammar as "an identification of systematic regularities in language". It plays an important role in language because it consists of a complex grammatical rule of language. As Swan (1977) stated that grammar is the rules that show how words are combined, arranged and changed to show certain kinds of meaning.

Sentence is one of the primary focuses in grammar. As Kolln and Funk (2009, p.5) stated that grammar is "the system of rules in our heads. It means we bring to the study of grammar a lifetime of knowing how to produce sentences". Grammar is the set of structural rules that govern the composition of clauses, phrases, and words in any given natural language. In addition Carter (2006) as cited in Sukalim (2009) stated that grammar concerned with how the constituent units of sentences (morphemes, words, phrases and clauses) are put together to form sentences.

2. The Role of Grammar

Mastering grammar plays an important role in the language learning process. According to Hall (1993, p.3) as cited in Fajriani (2014, p.8) "studying grammar will help one to learn about language". It is better for all the language learners or users to have good knowledge of the language grammar, so that there will be no wrong implication in communication. Finally, the goal of communication can be achieved successfully because of good language. In learning a second language, it will be easier for the students to translate and to understand what people said or wrote by mastering grammar. Therefore, by having right grammar, the students will be able to communicate well or can create a good communication.

It can be concluded that studying grammar is important. The good grammar mastery will create the correct language. Finally, the purpose of communication can be achieved successfully.

In this study, English grammar will be the main focused. The researcher will take an attention to a clause item as one of important units of grammar. The explanation about clause will be described in the following point.

B. Clause

1. The Definition of Clause

Clause is an important unit of a language, it also defined as a sentence. Clause consists of subject and verb. As Azar (2002, p.238) said that "a clause is a group of

words containing a subject and verb". The definition is also strengthened by Swan (2005) clause is a part of sentence which contains a subject and a predicate

2. The Types of Clause

There are two types of clause those are an independent clause, which a complete sentence and a dependent clause, which requires the presence of an independent clause to make up a complete sentence.

a. Independent Clause

According to Azar (2002) an independent clause or also called as main clause is a complete sentence. It can stand by itself as a sentence.

For example: The moon is shining in the sky.

b. Dependent Clause

Dependent clause or also called as subordinate clause is not a complete sentence. As Azar (2002) said that, a dependent clause is not a complete sentence. It must be connected to an independent.

A dependent clause may be an adverb clause, a noun clause, and a relative clause which all of them are the types of dependent clause.

For example: I know where brown lives

a) Adverb Clause

According to Azar (2002, p.365) "adverb clauses are used to show relationship between ideas. They show relationship of time, cause and effect, contrast, and condition".

For example: When he won the money, he decided to buy a car.

b) Noun Clause

According to Azar (2002) a noun clause is a type of dependent clause that acts as a noun. Noun clause is used as a subject or an object.

For example: Whatever she does is always wrong for him.

c) Relative Clause

A relative clause or adjective clause gets its name from the way it functions in a sentence, which is as an adjective. Adjective means word that describes a noun. Azar (2000 p.267) said that "a relative clause is a dependent clause that modifies a noun; it describes, identifies, or gives further information about noun".

For example: *The girl who played the violin* won the trophy.

In this study, from all types of clause, the researcher will take a focus on a dependent clause, specifically in relative clause. The deeper explanation about the relative clause will be explained on the following point.

C. Relative Clause

1. The Definition of Relative Clause

Relative clause is a part of clause which included in a dependent clause. The function of this clause is to modify a noun. As Azar (2002) stated that a relative clause is a dependent clause that modifies a noun. It describes, identifies, or gives further information about a noun. In addition, Frank (1979, as cited in Fajri, 2007) stated that in relative clause, subject and predicate is changed by means of special introductory word which has the same referent as the preceding noun or pronoun. The form and position of this introductory word subordinate the relative clause to a main clause. Relative clause is also known as adjective clause. It functions in a sentence, which is as an adjective. Adjective means word that describes a noun. Based on the definition we can conclude that an adjective clause or relative clause is introduced by a special introductory word which fixed to preceding noun or pronoun and it attached the relative clause to a main clause.

Relative clause introduced by the relative words or relative markers. Eastwood (1994) said that relative clauses are dependent clause that are introduced by the connecting words or relative clause markers (that, which, who, whom, whose, where, and when) and relative clause can be either restrictive or non restrictive as the type of relative clause.

2. The Types of Relative Clauses

There are two types of relative clause: restrictive and nonrestrictive clauses (defining or non-defining).

a. Restrictive Clauses

This type has function to limit or identify. As Gorell and Chalton (1964, as cited in Syarif, 2011) said that when modifiers limit closely, especially when the supply the information that identifies or distinguishes subject or complement, they are called restrictive. It also called defining relative clause.

Restrictive clause identifies or defines the noun phrase which they modify. For instance, "the professor who teaches Chemistry is an excellent lecturer". (No commas are used. The relative clause is necessary to identify which professor is meant).

Therefore, when the antecedent is limited by the relative clause to some of classes, the restrictive clauses do not use commas. For example, "the children who wanted to play soccer ran to an open field as soon as we arrived at the park. The others played a different game". (The lack of commas means that only some of the children wanted to play soccer. The relative clause is used to identify which children ran to open field).

b. Nonrestrictive Clauses

This type set off by commas in writing and by pauses in speaking. It also called non-defining relative clause. Thomson and Martinet (1986, as cited in Syarif, 2012) said that nonrestrictive clause is placed after nouns which are definite already. They do not define the noun, but merely add something to it by giving more information about it. Unlike restrictive clauses, they are not essential in the sentence and can be omitted without causing confusion. Also unlike defining relatives, they are separated from their noun by commas.

The function of nonrestrictive clauses does not limit or identify. They do not affect the intention. A nonrestrictive clause contains additional information which is not required to give the meaning of the sentence. For example: "Professor Wilson, who teaches Chemistry, is an excellent lecture". (Commas are used. The relative clause is not necessary to identify who Professor Wilson is, because we know who he is by his name).

2. The Usage of Relative Clause

There are 7 markers of relative clause: "who", "which", "that", "whom", "whose", "where" and "when". All of them have its explanation and usage as follows.

a. "Who"

This marker is used for describing subject or object pronoun for people. For example: I told you about the <u>woman</u> *who* sits in the canteen.

b. "Which"

Which is the marker that identifies subject or object pronoun for animals and things. According to Azar (2002) *"which"* is used as subject relative pronouns for animal and thing. For example: Do you see the cat which is lying on the roof?

c. Whose

"Whose" in relative clause takes part as possession for people animals and things. For example: Do you know the boy whose mother is a nurse?

d. Whom

It is object pronoun for people, especially in non-defining relative clauses. For example: I was invited by professor whom I met at the conference.

e. When

According to Esatwood (1994), we use "*when*" after nouns like time, period, moment, day, summer. For example: Do you remember the time when we all went to a night club?

f. Where

This clause is used to talk about the location or position of something. For example: He said he was happy where he was.

3. The Difficulties in Learning Relative Clause

It is not easy to understand and use clause especially in adjective clauses until someone faces the problem in learning it. Cook and Suter (1980, as cited in Syarif, 2001) gave two kinds of clause write a fragment. They said that if the person does not really understand the essential facts about clauses and they can easily stuck the habit of writing sentence fragment. Sentence fragments occur whenever someone uses a dependent clause or part of an independent clause as if it were a complete sentence. For example: *"because I need more money"*. Here the writer used a single adverbial clause as if it constituted a complete sentence. Fragment like this can be fixed by attacking the dependent clause to an independent clause, so that a truly complete sentence results, such as *"because I needed more money, I took a second job"*.

A second problem involving clauses concern the matter of choosing between the relative pronouns "*who*" and "*whom*". The distinction between them can be explained in several ways, but since most people are looking only for a simple test that will provide the correct pronoun each time. The simplest test we know of is to determine whether a subject noun (or subject pronoun) follows the relative pronoun. If it does, then *whom* should be used, if not, the correct pronoun is *who*. For example as follows:

- a. The attorney *whom I (subject pronoun)* contracted refused my case.
- b. The secretary whom Mrs. Tucker (subject noun) hired a superb typist.
- c. The doctor who treated ne is from India
- d. The person who tutored me changes very little

In addition, Michael Swan (1980, as cited in Syarif 2001) gave the examples of typical mistakes in relative clause as follows:

- a. There is the man who he teaches me the guitar.
- b. I do not like people which lose their temper easily
- c. Think you should stay faithful to the person whom you are married to

These sentences are definitely wrong. The first sentence is wrong because the clause is added "he: as though it is an adjective clause as object yet its function as subject that does not use he after the relative pronoun "who". The second sentence is

definitely wrong because the student do not know the function of relative pronoun which when the antecedent of person is used in this sentence. Who is used instead of which. And the last it is definitely wrong because the student use informal language. The function of relative pronoun as object of preposition does not put the preposition in the end of the sentence but before relative pronoun.

The correct sentence:

- There is the man **who** teaches me the guitar.
- I do not like people **who** lose their temper easily
- I think you should faithful to the person to whom you are married.

Based on the explanation above, the first is the meaning and the usage of relative clause especially about adjective clause. The first is the meaning and the usage of relative pronoun in formal language when it refers to antecedent. The second is the form of relative clause correctly when its function as subject, objects, or object of preposition. The last is the lack of knowledge in clauses until someone makes fragment.

C. Error

1. The Definition of Error

In learning a language especially second language, the students will face some problems. It is because the grammatical system is different with the students' mother tongue. On the other hand, the culture also will be an obstacle in learning language because every country has different cultures. Those obstacles can cause some errors in learning second language.

An error is a deviation from accuracy or correctness. According to Corder (1981) Error refers to regular patterns in the learners' speech which consistently differ from the target language model. According to Tarigan (1995, as cited in Fajriani, 2014) error is caused by competence factor. It means that the learner do not understand the second language system. It can be concluded that error here refers to the understanding and competence, so the focus here is the unsuccessful student in understanding the target language pattern.

2. The Sources of Error

According to Richard (1980), there are two sources of error. They are:

a. Interlanguage Error

Interlanguage error is an error which is caused by the interference of the learner's mother tongue. The term of interlanguage is proposed to analyze of the second language learning. This type of error is influenced by the learner's mother tongue aspects such as its culture, language structure, vocabulary, etc.

b. Intralingual Error

Intralingual error is an error which is influenced by the learner's language background. Intralingual and developmental error reflects the learner's competence in using language.

3. Error Analysis

In learning English, the students may make some errors. Here is the main role of English teacher. The teacher's role is to analyze the errors which are made by the students. Error analysis is useful for teaching and learning process. James (2001) claimed that error analysis is the process of determining the incidence, nature, causes and consequences of unsuccessful language. Through conducting error analysis, the teacher will find kinds of error which are often made by the students in learning English. Through conducting error analysis, the teacher may find some solutions to minimize the error which is faced by the students in learning English.

CHAPTER III

RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

A. Research Design

In this study, two research approaches are used. Namely quantitative and qualitative approach. Cresswell (2008) stated that quantitative research is a type of educational research in which the writer decides what to study; reviews the numbers analyzed by using statistics; and conducts the inquiry in an unbiased with objective manner. Using quantitative approach I tried to find students' errors in using relative clause through distributing paper test to them. In addition to complete the research and to answer second question of the study, I used qualitative approach to figure out why the students make the errors by conducting an interview. According to Ary (2002), qualitative research is conducted to describe the current status of phenomenon that exist at the time of study. In dealing with, descriptive design was used. According to Sylviene (2007), it is stated that descriptive research design is to describe groups, activities, or event with focus on structure, attitude or behavior.

B. Population and Sample

1. Population

According to Fraenkel and Wallen (2012), population is the group interest to the writer that would like to generalize the result of the study. In this study, the population is 90 students of 8th semester of Department of English language education in Universitas Islam Negeri Ar-Raniry, Banda Aceh.

2. Sample

Sample is the small quantity of population. Arikunto (2010) stated that sample is a limited number of elements from a population to be representative of the population. In this study, the researcher used simple random sampling as the sampling technique. Fraenkel and Wallen (2012) stated that a simple random sampling is the technique in which each and every member of the population has an equal and independent chance of being selected. The researcher then took 20% of the population to be the sample of this research. According to Gay & Diehl (1992) as cited in Alhaji (2010), for descriptive research the sample of population should be more than 10%. In the result, 20 students were taken as the sample who participated in the test. From 20 students, the researcher then took 8 students purposively for the students who had most errors in the test as the sample of interview.

C. Technique and Data Collection

In this part, the researcher used two techniques in collecting the data, those are: test and interview.

In the study, the test consists of 3 question formats: multiple choice, error analysis and sentence combination. The total question in each format was 10 questions so the whole question in this test is 30 questions. The students had 50 minutes to complete the test.

2. Interview

The researcher used interview to find the reasons or the difficulties of the students in using relative clause. In this part, the researcher used semi-structured interview to collect the data. According to Mackey and Gass (2005) semi-structured interview is a type of interview in which the researcher uses written list of question as a guide, but can digress and probe for more information". This technique focused on the item of relative clause that students had most errors.

D. Technique of Data Analysis

The first step of collecting data was to analyze the result of students test in using relative clauses. The researcher used the percentage system with the formula as follow:

P =x 100%

P = the percentage of students problem

f = the number of frequency of the respondents answer

n = the number of respondent

Having done the calculation of the errors, the researcher then calculates the average mark by using formula:

P =

P = the percentage of students problem

f = the number of frequency of the respondents answer

N = the number of respondent

n = number of item test

The last technique was interview to find information why the students made the errors. The study used semi-structured interview in which participants were given disorderly questions. There are 2 questions in the interwiew that would be asked to the students. The data of students' responses towards the difficulties in using relative clause was gathered through interview. Once the data collected, it will be transcribed. Later, the findings of the interview would be presented in narrative explanation that depict the students' difficulties in using relative clauses

CHAPTER IV

FINDING AND DISCUSSION

In this chapter, the researcher shows the result of the research which related to the students' errors on using relative clause. As explained on the previous chapter, the researcher used paper test and interview as the research instrument. Therefore, at the first point, the researcher will discuss about the findings of student paper test and then for the second point the researcher will discuss about the findings of interview. Thus, the findings will answer the research questions of this research.

A. Research Finding

1. The Result of the Test

Item	Types of error	Frequency of Error	Percentage of Errors
1	"which" refers to the whole	5	25%
	sentence		
2	General use of whose	14	70%
3	General use of where	6	30%
4	General use of where	2	10%
5	General use of whom	10	50%
6	General use of whom	13	65%
7	General use of where	1	5%
8	Quantifier + whom	14	70%
9	General use of when	5	25%
10	General use of who	5	25%
	Total	75	37.5%

 Table 4.1. Error Statistics of Multiple Choice Questions

The table above shows the results of student tests on multiple choice questions (Appendix IV). In this part, the total average of error was 39.5%. The highest percentage is seen on the questions number 2 and number 8 with 70%. Furthermore, the high percentage ia also seen on the question number 6 with the total of average error 65%. However, the lowest average of error was the question number 7 with 5% and the question number 4 with 10%.

Item	Types of error	Frequency of Error	Percentage of Errors
1	who + be	10	50%
2	General use of which/that	2	10%
3	General use of who	11	55%
4	General use of where	2	10%
5	Who $+ be$	16	80%
6	of + <i>which</i> and general use of <i>which</i>	20	100%
7	General use of whom	10	50%
8	General use of whose	19	95%
9	General use of where	9	45%
10	General use of where	5	25%
Total		104	52%

 Table 4.2. Error statistics of Error Analysis Questions

The table above describes the frequency of students' errors on error analysis questions (appendix IV). From 10 questions were offered the highest percentage of error seen in number 6 with the average of error is 100%. A high percentage is also seen on the question number 5 with 80%. In addition the question number 7 is also shows a high percentage of error with 70%. In the other hand, the lowest percentage is seen on the question number 2 and 4 with the average of error 10%

Item	Types of error	Frequency of Error	Percentage of Errors
1	General use of whose	11	55%
2	General use of where	10	50%
3	General use of whose	14	70%
4	General use of whose	13	65%
5	General use of where	5	25%
6	General use of when	3	15%
7	General use of whom	13	65%
8	General use of who	8	40%
9	General use of where	6	30%
10	General use of which/that	5	25%
	Total	88	44%

 Table 4.3. Error statistics of Sentence Combination Questions

The table above informs the total percentage of student's errors in using relative clause on sentence combination question (appendix IV). The total average of error in this part is 44%. From all of question, the highest percentage of error is on the question number 3 with 70%. Furthermore, on number 4 and 7 are in the same percentage error with 65%. In contrast, there are 3 questions which the lowest of average error. The question number 6 with 15% and the question number 5 and 10 with 25%.

No	Table	The total of items	Frequency of Error	The Average Percentage of Error
1	4.1	10 items	75	37.5%
2	4.2	10 items	104	52%
3	4.3	10 items	88	44%
Total		30 items	267	44.5%

Table 4.4. The Summary of Total Error of the Test

The table above is the results of all (30) questions on the test. The average of error of multiple choice question is 37.5% and error analysis form is the highest at 52% while the questions of sentence combination form is 44%. All in all, from 30 questions that provided in 3 form questions, the students had the average error of errors 44.5%.

Table	Item Number	Types of Error	Frequency of Error	Percentage of Errors
4.1	1	<i>which</i> refers to the whole sentence	5	25%
4.2	2	General use of <i>which/that</i>	2	10%
	6	of + which and general use of which	20	100%
4.3	10	General use of <i>which/that</i>	5	25%
	Total			27.5%

Table 4.5. Error Statistics of Relative Clause "which"

From the table 4.5, it can be seen that item number 6 is the highest percentage of error with 100%.

Item number 6 of table 4.2

- "There are ten universities in Thailand, seven of them locate in Bangkok is the

capital city".

Correct Respond :

 "There are ten universities in Thailand, <u>seven of which</u> are located in Bangkok, <u>which is</u> the capital city".

On this question, all students had the same error. They only focused on using relative clause "which" after the word Bangkok to describe it as a thing. However, they did not use relative clause "which" after "seven of". Actually, the students had to use relative clause "which" after the word "seven of" to carries meaning of "whose" which describes a thing. According to Azar (2002, p.286) "a noun + of which is the pattern that carries the meaning of "whose". This pattern is used in relative clause that modifies a thing and occurs primarily in formal English written".

In the other hand, the lowest percentage of error is seen on the question number 2 of error analysis with only 10% of total percentage.

Item number 2 of table 4.2

- "There is a small wooden screen separates the bed from the rest of the room".

Correct Respond

- "There is a small wooden screen <u>which/ that</u> separates the bed from the rest of the room".

On this question, there were 2 students who got error. Both students here considered that the sentence was correct, so they skipped it without any correction.

However, they should use relative clause *"which/that"* after the subject *"a small wooden screen"* because the relative clause here describes a thing.

Table	Item Number	Types of Error	Frequency of Error	Percentage of errors
4.1	3	General use of <i>where</i>	6	30%
	4	General use of <i>where</i>	2	10%
	7	General use of <i>where</i>	1	5%
4.2	4	General use of <i>where</i>	2	10%
	9	General use of <i>where</i>	9	45%
	10	General use of <i>where</i>	5	25%
4.3	2	General use of <i>where</i>	10	50%
	5	General use of <i>where</i>	5	25%
	9	General use of <i>where</i>	6	30%
	Total		46	25.55%

Table 4.6. Error Statistics of Relative Clause "where"

As a whole percentage of the table above, the researcher concluded that on this relative clause, students did not have much error. From all questions which focusing on this relative clause, the highest percentage of error is only 50%. As seen on the question number 2 of sentence combination with 50% as the highest percentage error.

Item Number 2 of table 4.3

- "The house was destroyed in an earthquake ten years ago" and

- "I was born and grew up there".

Correct Respond

"The house **where** I was born and grew up was destroyed in an earthquake ten years ago".

On this sentence, the relative clause describes the subject "*The house*" it means the relative clause which is used here to explain the place. So that, the relative clause "*where*" is the appropriate relative clause. In the fact, the researcher found that some students did not use relative clause "*where*" but they used relative clause "*which*".

"The house **which** I was born and grew up was destroyed in an earthquake ten years ago". (Incorrect)

Based on the sentence, the researcher guessed that the students used relative clause "*which*" because they considered it explained the thing "*The house*". Actually, if they looked at the meaning that inferred, the sentence completely talks about the place. Furthermore, the researcher also found a student who used relative clause "*when*" to combine the sentences.

"The house was destroyed in an earthquake ten years ago **when** I was born and grew up there". **(Incorrect)**

This sentence is completely incorrect because relative clause "*when*" explains the time (day, month, year, season, etc), while the sentence is not talking about the time. The high percentage error on using relative clause *"which"* also seen on the number 9 of error analysis with the total percentage is 45%.

Item number 9 of table 4.2

- "Ji Na comes from a place that it is very cold almost all year".

Correct Respond

- "Ji Na comes from a place where it is very cold almost all year".

Actually, the focus error here is similar like the previous item before. It is about the general use of relative clause "*where*". The relative clause "*that*" on the sentence should be replaced by "*where*" because it describes about the place. In the fact, the researcher found that all students who got error had the same correction. They did not use relative clause "where" but they used relative clause "*which*" on the sentence.

In this part, the lowest percentage of error can be seen on the item number 7 of multiple choice which the percentage of error only 5%.

Item number 7 of table 4.1

- "That is the drawer.... I keep my jewelry there".

Correct respond

- "That is the drawer <u>where I</u> keep my jewelry there".

The researcher found that, on this item only 1 student who got error. The student used relative clause "*who*" on this sentence. Obviously, this is incorrect because relative clause here completely explains about the place "*the drawer*". The

researcher guessed it occurred because the student just misunderstood the meaning of vocabulary *"drawer"*. *"Drawer"* here is the place not the person.

In addition, on the item number 4 of multiple choice is also seen as the low percentage of error, that is 10%.

Item number 4 of table 4.1

- "His new shirt didn't fit, so Dan took it back to the store.... he'd bought it".

Correct Respond

- "His new shirt didn't fit, so Dan took it back to the store <u>where</u> he'd bought it".

The item is seen easier because the students could analyze the subject or place directly to use the suitable relative clause. The item above is also focused on the general use of relative clause "*where*" which describes the place "*store*". However, there were only 2 students who got error. They did not use relative clause "*where*" but they used "*which*".

Table	Item Number	Types of Error	Frequency of Error	Percentage of errors
4.1	2	The general use of <i>whose</i>	14	70%
4.2	8	General use of <i>whose</i>	19	95%
4.3	1	General use of <i>whose</i>	11	55%
	3	General use of	14	70%

 Table 4.7. Error Statistics of Relative Clause "whose"

		whose		
	4	General use of	13	65%
		whose		
Total		71	88.75%	

The table 4.7 informs that the percentage of students' errors on using relative clause "*whose*". All of items focused on the general use of relative clause "*whose*". It can be seen that the percentage of each items are relatively high even this relative clause has the highest percentage of error of all relative clause other. The students got error more than 50% on all items, even the highest percentage is seen on 3 items with 70%, those are the item number 2 of multiple choice, the item number 8 of error analysis and the item number 3 of sentence combination. So that, the researcher concluded that the relative clause "*whose*" is more complicated than others.

Item Number 2 of table 4.1

- "I would never sit next to a person like raw garlic".

Correct Respond

- "I would never sit next to a person whose smell like raw garlic".

On this item, the researcher found that all students who got error choose the same wrong answer on the options. They choose option "who smelled". However, the correct answer here is "whose smell". The function of relative clause on this sentence is as possession and the relative clause on the sentence does not describe about subject person "a person".

Item number 8 of table 4.2

- "I sent the parents who I hiked with their son a picture of us on Mt. Fuji".

Correct Respond

- "I sent the parents whose son I hiked with a picture of us on Mt. Fuji".

Actually, the function of relative clause on the sentence is to explain the possession. In the fact, there were some variations of students' incorrect answer that researcher found on this item. Most students who got error on this item considered that the relative clause on this sentence was *"who"* which explained the subject person *"the parent"*.

"I sent the parents who I hiked with their son a picture of us on Mt. Fuji".

(Incorrect)

This item could be more difficult because the students not only had to take focus on the relative clause, but they also had to correct the whole sentence to be a correct sentence based on the relative clause that was chosen. Thus, they had to make sure, they made a good analyzing. As the researcher found, there were some students who was correct in correcting the relative clause *"who"* with *"whose"* but they did not correct the whole sentence. In the result, the sentence is still wrong.

"I sent the parents **whose** I hiked with their son a picture of us on Mt. Fuji". (Incorrect)

Furthermore, there were students who corrected the sentence with using relative clause "whom" after the word "the parents". It is incorrect because the function of relative clause "whom" is to describe the object person.

Item Number 3 of Table 4.3

- "I have to call the man". and

- "I accidentally picked up his umbrella after the meeting".

Correct Respond

"I have to call the man <u>whose</u> umbrella I accidentally picked up after the meeting".

On this item, students also gave some variations of incorrect corrections. Most students used relative clause "who" after the word "the man". In this part, the students may used relative clause "who" to describe the subject person.

"I have to call the man <u>who</u> umbrella I accidentally picked up after the meeting". (Incorrect)

On the other hand, some students used relative clause "*whom*" at the same place. Moreover, the researcher also found that there were some students who also used relative clause "*which*" to combine the two sentences.

Table 4.8. Error Statistics of Relative Clause "whom"					
Table	Item	Types of Error	Frequency of	Percentage of	

	Number		Error	errors
4.1	5	General use of <i>whom</i>	10	50%
	6	General use of <i>whom</i>	13	65%
	8	$\dots of + whom$	14	70%
4.2	7	General use of <i>whom</i>	10	50%
4.3	7	General use of <i>whom</i>	13	65%
	Total			60%

The table above shows the total percentage error of relative clause "whom". From the table, it can be seen the total percentage of errors are high, the percentage is almost similar with the percentage error of relative clause "whose". All of items also have more than 50% of percentage error. The highest percentage of error can be seen on the item number 8 of the multiple choice question with the percentage of error 70%.

Item number 8 of table 4.1

- "I have three brothers living in Texas, one of is a meditation teacher in Houston".

Correct Respond

"I have three brothers living in Texas, one of \underline{whom} is a meditation teacher in Houston."

On the sentence above, "whom" is the appropriate relative clause because it describes the object person of subject' "brothers". However, the researcher found two variations of student incorrect answers which referred to this item. Some students

did not choose the relative clause "whom" but they choose "who" even mostly students choose "them" to complete the sentence.

The next items which a high percentage are also seen on the item number 6 of multiple choice and number 7 of sentence combination with 65%.

Item Number 6 of table 4.1

- "When Jason arrived at the reunion, the first person..... he encountered was Sally Sellers, one of his best friends when he was in high school".

Correct Respond

"When Jason arrived at the reunion, the first person **whom** he encountered was Sally Sellers, one of his best friends when he was in high school".

The relative clause "whom" on the sentence above refers to the object of the subject "he" and it is appropriate relative clause to complete the sentence. On the other hand, many students got error in using relative clause. Most students choose relative clause "who".

"When Jason arrived at the reunion, the first person \underline{who} he encountered was

Sally Sellers, one of his best friends when he was in high school". (Incorrect)

The sentence above is incorrect because "who" refers to subject person, while the sentence needs the relative clause which describes an object person. The researcher thought that students here focused on "the first person", so because it is subject person, then they used relative clause "who" while they ignored the meaning that inferred. In addition, there were students who used relative clause "*which*" and "*whose*" to complete the sentence.

Item Number 7 of table 4.3

- "The singer was wonderful". and
- "We heard him at the concert".

Correct respond

"The singer whom we heard at the concert was wonderful".

The focused of relative clause "whom" on the sentence above is the same focused with the sentence on the item number 6 of table 4.1. Actually, the use of relative clause here is about the general use of relative clause "whom" that is to explain about the possession but some students also got error on this sentence. The students who got error here mostly did not used "whom" but they used "who" as the appropriate relative clause. It indicated that students considered that the subject here is the singer so the relative clause to explain the subject person is "who". However, the subject here is we, while the singer is object. The problem here is totally similar with the previous number.

Furthermore, there was a student who used "when" to combine the two sentences.

"The singer was wonderful when we heard him at the concert". (Incorrect)

"when" on the sentence is not a relative clause because it does not refer or describe any noun but it is just a connector to connect the two sentences.

The other items left, had the same problem with the previous items, those are the problem on the general use of relative clause *"whom"*

Table	Item Number	Types of Error	Frequency of Error	Percentage of errors
4.1	10	General use of who	5	25%
4.2	1	who + be	10	50%
	3	General use of who	11	55%
4.3	8	General use of who	8	40%
Total			34	42.5%

Table 4.9. Error Statistics of Relative Clause "who"

The table above shows the students percentage error on using relative clause *"who"*. It can be seen that the highest percentage of error is 55% on the item number 11. Lower than that, there is item number 3 also has a high percentage. On the other hand, the lowest percentage can be seen on the number 10 of table 4.1 which only has 25%.

Item Number 3 of tale 4.2

- "When I was a child, I was always afraid of the beggars whom they went from house to house in my neighborhood".

Correct Respond

- "When I was a child, I was always afraid of the beggars <u>who</u> went from house to house in my neighborhood".

On the sentence above, the researcher found that 3 different answers of all students who got error. Most students considered that the sentence was correct. However, the sentence above is incorrect because relative clause *"whom"* is not the

relative clause which describes a subject but it described the object. Meanwhile on the sentence, *"the beggars"* is the subject person. Therefore, the appropriate relative clause here is *"who"*. In addition, some students had corrected the relative clause with *"who"* but they did not correct the subject *"they"* which comes after it.

"When I was a child, I was always afraid of the beggars **who they** went from house to house in my neighborhood". **(Incorrect)**

The correction is still wrong because the relative clause "who" has explain about the subject so that the sentence does not need "they" to explain the subject more. The important thing that must be remembered, after relative clause "who" is always followed by verb.

Furthermore, there were students who used "when" to correct the relative clause "whom". "When" on the sentence does not refer to subject or object. Thus, it is not as relative clause.

"When I was a child, I was always afraid of the beggars <u>when</u> they went from house to house in my neighborhood". (Incorrect)

The researcher also found that there was a student who used relative clause "*where*" at the same place. This is completely wrong, the sentence is not talking about the place.

The high percentage of error is also seen on the item number 1 error analysis with 50%.

Item Number 1 of table 4.2

- "There are some people in the government who is trying to improve the lives of poor people".

Correct Respond

- "There are some people in the government who <u>are</u> trying to improve the lives of poor people".

Some students who got error skipped the item because they thought that the sentence was correct. Actually, the problem of the sentence is on the verb which follows the relative clause. The relative clause "*who*" has corrected to describe about the subject "*some people*" but the students has to take focus on the verb which follows. The verb must be appropriate with the subject, thus it should be "*are trying*". Based on this error the researcher thought that the students did not analyze the meaning of the sentence as a whole but they only focused on the placement of relative clause based on the subject.

Moreover, there were students who used relative clause "whose" and "which" to replace relative clause "who" on the sentence. Both relative clauses do not describe the subject "some people".

The lowest percentage of relative clause "who" seen on the item number 10 of table 4.1 with 25%

Item number 10 of table 4.1

- "I discussed the ethical question with Prof. Mayer teaches philosophy and religion".

Correct respond

- "I discussed the ethical question with Prof. Mayer **who** teaches philosophy and religion".

The researcher found that there were students used relative clause "*whom*" to complete the sentence. The relative clause is not appropriate because the relative clause should be describe the subject not the object

Table	Item Number	Types of Error	Frequency of Error	Percentage of errors
4.1	9	The general use of <i>when</i>	5	20%
4.3	6	The general use of <i>when</i>	3	15%
Total			8	20%

Table 4.10. Error Statistics of Relative Clause "when"

The relative clause "*when*" as showed on the table above had a low percentage of error even the percentage of relative clause "*when*" is the lowest of all relative clauses. There were 2 items which focused on this relative clause both items has percentage of error lower than 50%. As seen on the table, on the item number 4 of multiple choice, students had error 20%.

Item number 4 of table 4.1

- "There came a time.....the miser had to spend his money then".

Correct Respond

- "There came a time **when** the miser had to spend his money then".

Based on the paper test result, on this sentence all students who got error did not used relative clause *"when"* but they used *"which"*. However, the sentence needs the relative clause which explains about the time and it is *"when"*

On the next item, the question number 6 of sentence combination is lower, with 15% of error percentage.

Item number 6 of table 4.3

- "July is the month" and
- "The weather is usually the hottest then".

Correct Respond

- "July is the month **when** the weather is usually the hottest then".

On this sentence, the researcher found that there were 2 students who used relative clause *"where"* to combine the two sentences.

"July is the month where the weather is usually the hottest then". (Incorrect)

The relative clause *"where"* above is clearly incorrect because *"where"* is the relative clause which refers to the place, so it does not describe the time *"the month"*

All in all, based on analysis above, the average students' error of all question forms is 44.5%. Moreover, from 3 forms of question that provided, the highest percentage of average error of each form is error analysis question form with 52% and the lowest one is the sentence combination with 44% while the multiple choice form on the middle with 37.5%.

In addition, based on the calculation above the highest percentage of error in each markers are on the question number 6 of error analysis with the typical of marker *which* with the 100% of total average of error. Lower than that is the question which the average of error is 95 % on the question number 8 of error analysis with the problem of "possession" or "whose"

2. The Result of Interview

In this section, the researcher informs the results of interview which involved 8 students as the research samples. The focus on this result was about the relative clauses which mostly students got errors on it. Moreover, it also focused on the specific item of the paper test result which had a high percentage of error and also about some items which researcher considered that was needed to be focused.

There were 2 questions which were asked by researcher on the interview:

- 1) Why do you choose or use the error relative clause?
- 2) What are your problems on using relative clause?
- Question number 1: Why do you choose or use the error relative clause?

On the first question, the researcher focused on asking the error markers or the incorrect sentence which made by students. Based on the result of paper test, the most percentage error was on relative clause "whose" and "whom". Therefore, the researcher focused on explaining the two relative clauses.

a. The Result of Interview which Focusing on Relative Clause "Whom"

From the 8 students who got error on this relative clause, the researcher found some student responds on interview which related to the student incorrect answers on using relative clause *"whose"*, as follows:

1) On the item number 2 of table 4.1

Question : I would never sit next to a person like raw garlic.

Incorrect Answer I :

I would never sit next to a person who smelled like raw garlic

Students' Responds :

On this item, there were some variation answers of all students. Some students answered with "On this sentence, I choose relative clause <u>"who"</u> because it explains the subject person of "a person".

In addition, some students also gave an answer which slightly different with the previous student answer, they respond it as "*Here I used relative clause* <u>who</u> because I thought it refers to the subject "a person". The next reason was about the sentence. This sentence was past perfect so I thought "who smelled" that I choose here is past sentence so it matched. But the main reason for this incorrect answer was I really difficult to understand how the appropriate relative clause in a sentence and I think relative clause "whose" is similar with relative clause "who" and "whose" because both relative clauses refers to the person.

2) On item number 8 of table 4.2

Question : I sent the parents who I hiked with their son a picture of us on Mt. Fuji.

Incorrect Answer I:

I sent the parents who I hiked with their son a picture of us on Mt. Fuji.

Students' Responds :

` *"I used relative clause <u>who</u> on this sentence because it refers to parents and <i>I did not know the use of relative clause <u>whose</u>".*

Incorrect Answer II :

I sent the parents *whom* I hiked with their son a picture of us on Mt. Fuji.

Students' Responds :

"When I analyzed the sentence, I found that the focus here was on the **parents** and the parents here is an object so then I choose the relative clause <u>whom</u> because as long as I know it refers to the object person".

Incorrect Answer III :

I sent the parents whose I hiked with their son a picture of us on Mt. Fuji.

Students' Responds :

"I knew that the meaning of this sentence was about possession of the son, so that I used relative clause <u>whose</u>. I admit that I did not rearrange the sentence as suitable as the placement of relative clause whose in the sentence. I just thought that I had to place the suitable relative clause after the subject (parents)".

3) On item number 1 of table 4.3

Question : - Mr. North teaches a class for students.

- Their native language is not English.

Incorrect Answer I :

Mr. North teaches a class for students **where** their native language is not English. There was a student gave the answer like

Students' Responds :

"On this sentence, I thought the relative clause here refers to the place where the teacher is teaching, that is class. So that I used relative clause <u>where</u>".

Incorrect Answer II :

Mr. North teaches a class for students **whom** their native language is not English.

Students' Responds :

"I used relative clause <u>whom</u> here, because I thought <u>whom</u> refers to the object person students. I have to admit that on this question I did not understand well about the meaning of the sentence"

Incorrect Answer III:

Mr. North teaches a class for students which their native language is not English.

Students' Responds :

"To be honest, I did not understand about how to combine this sentence. I just answered the question based on my feeling; I tried to make it sense and the relative clause *which* here was make sense if I put on this sentence. In addition, I did not know the use of relative clause whose".

4) On item number 3 of table 4.3

Question : - I have to call the man

I accidentally picked up his umbrella after the meeting.

Incorrect Answer I :

I have to call the man **who** I accidentally picked up his umbrella after the meeting.

Student's Responds :

On this question, all students who got error gave an answer which focused on the same problem. Here is one of the students' respond of the sentence "my focused on combining this sentence was on the subject "the man" because it is subject person, so the I choose relative clause <u>"who"</u>

5) On item number 4 of table 4.3

- Question : The people were nice
 - We visited their house.

Incorrect Answer I :

The people were nice when visited their house.

Student's Responds :

The students who got error on this answer has the same respond, here is one of the respond. "I choose relative clause <u>when</u> because when I translated it to my

language, the word "ketika" or "when" was appropriate to combine the two sentences, so that the sentence would be "the people were nice **when** we visited their home" ("orang-orang itu baik, ketika kita mengunjungi rumah nya").

b. The Result of Interview which Focusing on Relative Clause "Whom"

Based on the 8 students who got error on this relative clause, the researcher found some student responds on interview which related to the student incorrect answers on using relative clause "*whom*", as follows:

1) Item Number 5 of table 4.1

Question : Have you ever read any books by the author....the teacher mentioned in class this morning?

Incorrect Answer I :

Have you ever read any books by the author which the teacher mentioned in

class this morning?

Students' Responds :

"I think the relative clause here refers to the book, so that I choose relative clause <u>which</u>, and I have to admit that it is should be **whom**, and to be honest I do not understand with this one (whom)".

Incorrect Answer II :

Have you ever read any books by the author **who** the teacher mentioned in class this morning?

Students' Responds :

"Relative clause <u>who</u> here I choose because I thought it describes about the author. The author here is the person, so that I choose it because the function of relative clause who is describing the person".

2) Item Number 6 of table 4.1

Question : When Jason arrived at the reunion, the first person..... he encountered was Sally Sellers, one of his best friends when he was in high school.

Incorrect Answer I :

When Jason arrived at the reunion, the first person **who** he encountered was Sally Sellers, one of his best friends when he was in high school.

Students' Responds :

"I think the relative clause here refers to the first person, and as long as I know the relative clause which refers to person is only <u>who</u>"

Incorrect Answer II :

When Jason arrived at the reunion, the first person **which** he encountered was Sally Sellers, one of his best friends when he was in high school.

Students' Responds :

"I do not know how I used the relative clause which on this sentence, I know it should be whom. I think this is purely about my careless during answering the question".

3) Item Number 8 of table 4.1

Question : I have three brothers living in Texas, one of is a meditation teacher in Houston.

Incorrect Answer I :

I have three brothers living in Texas, one of **who** is a meditation teacher in Houston.

Students' Responds :

"I choose relative clause <u>who</u> here because I thought it describes about subject **three brothers** but I think this is incorrect because I did not understand about the meaning of the sentence. The relative clause here should be refers to the object three brothers".

4) Item Number 7 of table 4.3

Question : - The singer was wonderful.

- We heard him at the concert.

Incorrect Answer I :

The singer was wonderful who we heard him at the concert.

Students' Responds :

"I choose relative clause <u>who</u> because it refers to **a person** (singer). I know that both <u>who</u> and <u>whom</u> are relative clause that describes a person but I do not know how to differ it".

Incorrect Answer II :

The singer was wonderful when we heard him at the concert.

Student's Responds :

"When I answered the question I tried to bring it to my language (Indonesia language) before I combined the two sentences. So in my opinion the relative clause when was appropriate to combine the two sentences because the meaning in Indonesia language would be Peyanyi itu hebat ketika kita mendengarnya saat konser".

Furthermore, based on the result of paper test, the students had 100 % of average error on the item number 6 of error analysis.

Item Number 6 of table 4.2

Question : There are ten universities in Thailand, seven of them locate in Bangkok is the capital city.

Actually, on this question there were 2 corrections that must be focused. Firstly, the students should correct "seven of them" to "seven of which" and then they also had to add which after "Bangkok". All students had the same correction, they only focused on adding relative clause "which" after "Bangkok".

Incorrect Answer I :

There are ten universities in Thailand, seven of them locate in Bangkok which is the capital city.

Students' Responds :

"When I analyzed the sentence, I focused on the noun which must be explained by relative clause, and I thought the word Bangkok must be explained by relative clause. I really did not take attention the "seven of them" because I thought it was correct. The point is I do not know before relative clause which with this pattern".

Incorrect Answer II :

There are ten universities in Thailand, seven of them locate in Bangkok is the capital city. (no change)

Students' Responds :

On this sentence, I completely did not understand about where I should place the relative clause, so then I skipped it.

On the other hand, the researcher also found that some students got error on 2 items (item number 7 of table 4.1 and number 3 of tale 4.2) because of the lack vocabulary mastery.

Item number 7 of table 4.1

Question : That is the drawer....I keep my jewelry there.

Incorrect Answer I :

That is the drawer <u>who</u> I keep my jewelry there Students' Responds : "In this item, I used relative clause "who" because I refers to the subject <u>drawer</u>. I thought the meaning of drawer here was a drawer who draws the pictures

Item number 3 of table 4.2

Question : When I was a child, I was always afraid of the beggars which they went from house to house in my neighborhood.

Incorrect Answer I :

When I was a child, I was always afraid of the beggars *when* they went from house to house in my neighborhood.

Student's Responds :

"I choose "whom" because when I translate it into my language the sentence will be "ketika saya kecil, saya selalu takut kepada beggars ketika mereka datang dari rumah kerumah" so when or "ketika" on this sentence is make sense, in addition I confused with the noun that explained by relative clause here, I know the relative clause explain the word **beggars**, **but I do not know the meaning of this word."**

- Question Number 2 : What are your problems on using relative clause?

On this question, the researcher focused on finding the factors of student's errors on using relative clause. According to the question above, all students gave some variation of responds, as follows:

a. Students' Respond I

"Relative clause is difficult study and the main problem here is I really difficult to answer the relative clause question even it is more difficult when we make a sentence with using relative clause by ourselves than to answer the relative clause question".

b. Students' Respond II

"The main problem here is about the variation of English relative clause even there are some relative clause which almost similar in the usage".

c. Students' Respond III

"I relative clause is very complicated especially in matching the appropriate relative clause with the sentence".

d. Students' Respond IV

"I think, in relative clause the most problem here is to understand the sentence and vocabulary mastery".

e. Students' Respond V

"To be honest, I do not know well about the relative clause item. When I answered or made the relative clause sentences, I just transferred the sentence to Indonesia language. If I feel it was good, so then I choose it. In addition, this problem also caused by my ignorance and honestly, I do not understand with this and in addition, forget is also being my main problem".

f. Students' Respond VI

"The most problem that I had is I really difficult to analyze the sentence"

g. Students' Respond VII

"I think, my problem was I did not concern with this item, because I think as I remembered when I learnt the relative clause in the class I did not give attention well to the lecturer so that it makes me do not understand with this, in addition I do not train myself to learn about this independently".

B. Discussion

The aim of this study is to know the students' errors in using relative clause and to know why they faced difficulties until they make errors.

What are the errors faced by the students in using relative clause? From the table above, most students made errors on "*whose*" with the average of error 88.75%. This frequency is the highest of all. In addition, most students also made errors on "*whom*" with the average of error 60%.

The second question is about why do the students faced difficulties in using relative clause? From the interview, the researcher got several factors as follow:

1. Confusion in using of Relative Clause

Based on the interview, the researcher found most students confused in using relative clause markers in each sentences. They stated that the relative clause is a difficult material. The students claimed, the cause of confusion is the varieties of English relative clause markers. They do not know well about relative clause. Most students only understand the common relative clauses, such as, "which, "who", and "that" while the others are still confusing. For example, the question number 1 of the multiple choice questions. I would never sit next to a person like raw garlic. The correct marker here is "whose" because it actually talks about the possession. In practice, some students answered it with using relative clause "who". Based on the interview the researcher found that they thought the sentence was correct because they often use "who" in many forms of sentences and they do not know the use of "whose". In addition, Most of students were difficult to differ the relative clause "who" and "whom" because both relative clauses refer to a person.

2. Overemphasis on Language Forms

Students in the process of learning grammar rules, sometimes only focus on the form of a language. They just focused on the rule of placing the relative clauses. The negative impact of this is making students ignore the meaning of the language or even they ignore the other grammar units inside. For example, on the question number 8 of error analysis question "*I sent the parents who I hiked with their son a picture of us on Mt. Fuji*". The meaning of this sentence is to inform that the subject "T" on the sentence sent a picture of their pose on Mt. Fuji to the parent whose son is hiked with the subject "I". The problem here actually is about the possession of son. So that, it should be I sent the parents whose son I hiked with a picture of us on Mt. *Fuji*. Some students did not analyze the meaning of this sentence. They just focused on placing the suitable relative clause for the subject (people).

3. The Lack of Vocabulary Mastery

Based on interview and the test, some students claimed that their errors were also caused by lacking in vocabulary mastery. This actually gave a negative effect on their learning of relative clause because the relative clause modifies the subject, so that, if the students do not know the vocabulary in the sentence, the students will misinterpret the appropriate relative clauses. For example "*that is the drawer*.....*I keep my jewelry there*." here some students considered the word "*drawer*" as a subject of person, that is a drawer who draws a picture, so that, the students choose the relative clause which explains the subject of person. In contrast, actually the word here means the place. Drawer is the place where we put or keep something and the appropriate relative clause is "*where*".

4. Language Transfer Problem

Language transfer is one of the reasons that let learners make errors. Language transfer can be called interlanguage interference, referring to that fact that the rules of mother tongue interfere with the second language learning, causing learners errors on using target language. As the researcher found on some items, the students got error because they analyze the meaning of the sentence with their mother tongue context. Mother tongue plays an important role in learning the target language. Because mother tongue is the most used means of expressing and has reached the level of automation, so in the process of learning, mother tongue language forms and structures will unconsciously be migrated to learners.

The researcher considered that this factor is a common factor which frequently occurred on foreign learner. As the other research by Xiaoli Bao who focusing on Senior High School Students' Errors on the Use of Relative Words in China on 2014 also found that the problem of student's error on this item was there are not any relative clauses in Chinese language. Although there are attributes in Chinese, it is distinct from the relative clause in English language. As a result, Chinese students did not understand the rule of English relative clause so well.

CHAPTER V

CONCLUSION AND SUGGESTION

In this section, the researcher presents the conclusions about this research. Furthermore, the researcher also gives some suggestions to the students and lecturers about some problems especially about the problems which caused students' errors in using relative clauses.

A. Conclusions

The researcher would like to conclude that based on the result of study as follows:

- 1. The average errors of the test are 44.5%. For specific calculation, most of students made errors on "*whose*" with the average of errors 88.75% and it is the highest percentage error on this test. In addition, a high percentage of error is also seen on the relative clause "*whom*" with the average of errors 60%.
- 2. The causes of students' difficulties in using relative clauses are:
 - a. Confusion in using Relative Clause
 - b. Overemphasis on Language Forms
 - c. The Lack of Vocabulary Mastery

d. Language Transfer Problem

B. Suggestions

The researcher would like to present some suggestions to the lecturers and students in order to reduce the errors in using relative clause as follows:

a. For Students

1. Pay More Attention on Grammar Especially on Relative Clause

The students should pay more attention to study grammar, especially on relative clause. Based on the result of the research, most students are considered still in low in understanding of relative clause. The result showed that most students only know the general use of the common relative clauses which they used, those are "who", "which" and "that"

2. Develop the Vocabulary Mastery

The students have to add or develop their mastery in vocabulary. Vocabulary in the relative clause is very significant, because the vocabulary will determine what relative clause should be used. In contrast, the result showed that there were some students still confused with some vocabularies.

3. Develop the Ability of Analyzing the Sentence

Based on the result, the unsuccessful in analyzing the sentence is also the main students' problem on using relative clause. The students suggested can make the effort in order to gain a good analyzing in the sentence. Relative clause is not about placing a marker of relative clause after the noun that followed only. Sometimes it could be not described about noun that followed, such as the use of *"whose"* (possession). So that, the students has to analyze the meaning of the sentence comprehensively. The students can get it through reading and trying to answer the questions about relative clause.

b. For Lecturers

1. Teaching the Relative Clause Should Be Comprehensive

Lecturers should give a clear explanation and compare the differences between the usages and let students practice using them correctly. The researcher thought that comparison is an effective way to deepen students' understanding. For example, when teaching relative clause, lecturers should compare the usages of *"who"* and *"whom"* and make it clear that when *"who"* should be used and when *"whom"* should be used, because based on the result of the research there were many students who still confused with the relative clauses that referred to the same subject or noun.

2. Strengthen the Students' Learning Strategy Instruction

Lecturers can guide students' self-reflection; find out the deficiency of study; encourage students to collect wrong questions; establish bank of wrong questions and reflect on why they make errors; encourage students to learn to sum up and make up for weakness of teachers' teaching. Even the lecturers can find the effective teaching strategy in teaching relative clause. In this way, hopefully, students can used it into their study efficiently and effectively.

3. Training the Students to Think in English

Training students to think in English way can help students to improve their language awareness. Lecturers could try to find a way to make students use relative clause either in oral or written form in or out of class. Practicing using relative clause not only motivate students' knowledge in their mind; train them to think in English, but also give students opportunity to make self-examination and give students opportunity to realize their weaknesses.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Anggraini, R. D. 2008. An error analysis on using adjective clause of the second year student of SMA Negeri 1 Kebakkramat. Muhammadiah University of Surakarta. Thesis
- Ary, D. 2002. *Introduction in research in education*. Belmont: Wadsworth Thomson learning.
- Arikunto, S. 2010. *Prosedur penelitian suatu pendekatan praktek*. Jakarta: PT. Bina Aksara.
- Azar, B. S. 2002. Understanding and using English grammar (3rd edition). New York: Pearson Education.
- Bao, X. 2015. Senior high school students' errors on the use of relative words. Tongliao, China: Canadian Center of Science and Education.

Cole, P., & Tjung, Y. 2003. *The formation of relative clauses in Jakarta Indonesian*. University of Delaware. Thesis

- Corder, S. P. 1981. *Error analysis and interlanguage*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Creswell, J. W. 2008. *Educational research: Planning, conducting, and evaluating quantitative and qualitative research* (4th edition). Boston: Pearson.
- Downing, A. 2006. English grammar. New York: Routledge.
- Dulay, H., & Krashen, S. 1982. Language two. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Eastwood, J. 1994. *Oxford guide to English grammar*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Ewing, M., & Cumming, S. 1998. *Relative clause in Indonesian discourse: Face to face and cyberspace interaction*. University of California. Thesis

Fajri, A. 2007. An analysis of relative clause in george bernard shaw's play

"arms and the man". University of North Sumatra Medan. Thesis

- Fajriani, A. 2014. *An error analysis in relative clause*. Muhammadiyah University of Purwokerto. Thesis
- Fraenkel, J. R., & Wallen, N. E. 2012. *How to design and evaluate research in education*. New York: McGraw-Hill.
- Gay, L. R., & Diehl, P. L. 1992. *Research methods for business and management*. New York: MacMillan Publishing Company.
- James, C. 2001. *Errors in language learning and use: Exploring error analysis*. Beijing: Teaching and Research Press.
- Kolln, M., & Funk, R. 2009. *Understanding English grammar*. United States of America: Pearson Education Inc.
- Mackey, A & Gass, S. M. 2005. *Second language research: Methodology and design*. New Jersey: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates.
- Musonah. 2014. An analysis on students' error in using relative pronouns . Syarif Hidayatullah State Islamic University. Thesis
- Richard, J. 1980. *Error analysis: Perspective on second language acquisition.* London: Longman.

Sukalim, H. 2009. Error analysis in combining sentences by using adjective clause by

fourth semester student of English literature department in Bina Nusantara University. Bina Nusantara University. Thesis

- Swan, M. 2005. Practical English usage. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Syarif, A. 2011. *An analysis of students' errors in using adjective clause*. Syarif Hidayatullah State Islamic University. Thesis

Tarigan, H. G. 2009. Pengajaran analisis kesalahan berbahasa. Bandung: Angkasa.

Merriam-webster.com. The Meaning of Difficulty. Retrieved from <u>http://www.merriam-webster.com/dictionary/difficulty</u>, accessed on April 28, 2016.

INTERVIEW

- 1. Why do you chose / make the sentence like this?
- 2. What is your main problem in understanding relative clause?

PAPER TEST

Dear students;

You are kindly requested to complete this questionnaire with real honesty. This questionnaire is used for research purposes only. Therefore it is important to take it seriously.

Name:

- Sex: male female
- Age: Born in: 19.....
- Phone number:
- Semester:....

Part A

MULTIPLE CHOICE QUESTIONS

Direction: Choose the correct answer for the sentences below

- Harry got fired from his job,.... meant that he could collect unemployment insurance for 26 weeks.
 - a. where b. which c. who d. whose
- 2. I would never sit next to a person like raw garlic.
 - a. who he smelled b. whose smell
 - b. c. who smelled d. that smell
- Every neighborhood in Brussels has small cafes.....customers drink coffee and eat pastries there.
 - a. Which b. whose c. who d. where
- 4. His new shirt didn't fit, so Dan took it back to the store..... he'd bought ita. Which b. where c. who d. whose
- 5. Have you ever read any books by the author....the teacher mentioned in class this morning?

	a. whom	b. which	c. who	d. whose	
6.	When Jason arrived at the reunion, the first person he encountered was Sally Sellers, one of his best friends when he was in high school.				
	a. whom	b. which	c. whose	d. who	
7.	That is the drawerI keep my jewelry there.				
	a. where	`b. who	c. whose	d. when	
8.	I have three brothers living in Texas, one of Houston			. is a meditation teacher in	
	a. whom	b. who	c. which	d. them	
9.	There came a tim a. when		had to spend his		

- 10. I discussed the ethical question with Prof. Mayer teaches philosophy and religion.
 - a. whom b. who c. who are d. who is

Part B

ERROR ANALYSIS QUESTIONS

There are mistakes in some following sentences below. Please find the mistakes and rewrite the correct answer, or if you think the sentence is true, you just skip it.

For example: Almost all of the people appear on television wear makeup.Answer: Almost all of the people who / that appear on television wear makeup

- There are some people in the government who is trying to improve the lives of poor people.
 Answer:
- There is a small wooden screen separates the bed from the rest of the room.

Answer:

- When I was a child, I was always afraid of the beggars whom they went from house to house in my neighborhood. *Answer:*
- 4. A cafe is a small restaurant which people can get a light meal.

Answer:

- The boy drew pictures of people at an airport which was waiting for their planes. Answer:
- There are ten universities in Thailand, seven of them locate in Bangkok is the capital city. *Answer:*
- 7. Have you ever read any books by the author who the teacher mentioned in class this morning? *Answer:*
- 8. I sent the parents who I hiked with their son a picture of us on Mt. Fuji. *Answer:*

9. Ji Na comes from a place that it is very cold almost all year.

Answer:

10. The miser hid his money in a place which it was safe from robbers.

Answer:

Part C

SENTENCE COMBINATION QUESTIONS

Directions: Combine the two sentences into one sentence by using adjective clause who, whom, whose, which, when, or where

For example: The man called the police. His wallet was stolen.

Answer: The man whose wallet was stolen called the police.

- Mr. North teaches a class for students. Their native language is not English. *Answer:*
- The house was destroyed in an earthquake ten years ago.
 I was born and grew up there.

Appendix IV

Answer:

- 3. I have to call the man.I accidentally picked up his umbrella after the meeting.*Answer:*
- 4. The people were nice.

We visited their house.

Answer:

- Every neighborhood in Brussels has small cafes. Customers drink coffee and eat pastries there. *Answer:*
- 6. July is the month.

The weather is usually the hottest then (in that month). *Answer:*

7. The singer was wonderful.

We heard him at the concert. *Answer:*

8. The people brought a small gift.

They came to dinner.

Answer:

- 9. The miser hid his money in a place.It was safe from robbers there.*Answer:*
- 10. The chair is an antique.Sally inherited it from her grandmother.*Answer:*

ANSWER KEY

Part A: MULTIPLE CHOICES QUESTIONS

- 1. b. which
- 2. b. whose smell
- 3. d. where
- 4. b. where
- 5. a. whom
- 6. a. whom
- 7. a. Where

- 8. a. whom
- 9. a. When
- 10. b. who

Part B: ERROR ANALYSIS QUESTIONS

- There are some people in the government who are trying to improve the lives of poor people.
- 2. There is a small wooden screen which/that separates the bed from the rest of the room
- When I was a child, I was always afraid of the beggars who went from house to house in my neighborhood.
- 4. A cafe is a small restaurant where people can get a light meal
- The boy drew pictures of people at an airport who/that were waiting for their planes. OR The boy drew pictures of people who/that were waiting for their planes at an airport.
- There are ten universities in Thailand, seven of which are located in Bangkok, which is the capital city
- 7. Have you ever read any books by the author whom the teacher mentioned in class this morning?
- 8. I sent the parents whose son I hiked with a picture of us on Mt. Fuji.
- 9. Ji Na comes from a place where it is very cold almost all year.

10. The miser hid his money in a place where it was safe from robbers

Part C: SENTENCE COMBINATION QUESTIONS

- 1. Mr. North teaches a class for students whose native language is not English.
- 2. The house where I was born and grew up was destroyed in an earthquake ten years ago.
- 3. I have to call the man whose umbrella I accidentally picked up after the meeting.
- 4. The people whose house we visited were nice
- Every neighborhood in Brussels has small cafes where customers drink coffee and eat vestries.
- July is the month when the weather is usually the hottest. OR July is the month that the weather is usually the hottest. OR July is the month which the weather is usually the hottest.
- 7. The singer whom we heard at the concert was wonderful.
- 8. The people who came to dinner brought a small gift.
- 9. The miser hid his money in a place where it was safe from robbers.
- 10. The chair which/that sally inherited from her grandmother is an antique.

AUTOBIOGRAPHY

Name	: Satria Zulkarnein			
Place / Date of Birth	: Alue Bilie, 4 February 1994			
Religion	: Islam			
Sex	: Male			
Nationality / Ethnic	: Indonesia / Acehnese			
Marital Status	: Single			
Occupation	: Student			
Address	: Sukaraja, kec Darul Makmur kab. Nagan Raya			
E-mail	: zulkarnein.satria@gmail.com			
10. Parents' Name				
a. Father	: Zulhusaini IA, A.Md			
b. Mother	: Nurbaidah			
c. Occupation	: Civil Servant			
Address	: Sukaraja, kec Darul Makmur kab. Nagan Raya			
12. Education Background				
a. Elementary School	: SDN 1 Alue Bilie (2000-2006)			
b. Junior High School	: MTsS Nurul Falah, Meulaboh (2006-2009)			
c. Senior High School	: SMAN 4 Wira Bangsa, Meulaboh (2009-2012)			
d. University	: UIN Ar-Raniry (2012-2016)			
	Place / Date of Birth Religion Sex Nationality / Ethnic Marital Status Occupation Address E-mail Parents' Name a. Father b. Mother c. Occupation Address Education Background a. Elementary School b. Junior High School c. Senior High School			

Banda Aceh, August 10th, 2016 The Researcher,

Satria Zulkarnein