

Hybrid Modelling of Islamic Piety Via Exploratory Factor Analysis and An Artificial Neural Network

Reviewer Affiliation

Universitas Islam Negeri Ar-Raniry, Faculty of Islamic Economics and Business

Manuscript ID:

SO-20-1747

Manuscript Type

SAGE Open - Research Paper

Methods

Artificial Neural Network, exploratory factor analysis (EFA), Mixed method

Approaches

Mixed

Main Discipline or Subject Area

Business & Management

Keywords

Spirituality, Islamic Piety, Islamic Social Responsibility, Hybrid Model, Artificial Neural Network

Date Assigned:

15-Jul-2020

Date Review Returned:

26-Jul-2020

M-Score for this manuscript:

3.91

Please note that in the event of the rejection of this paper, in conjunction with the author's decision to refer their manuscript, it may be transferred for consideration in another SAGE journal. Your review comments may also be transmitted as well. Your identity will remain confidential to the author but will be disclosed to the editor.

req Literature review and use of references

Adequate

Evaluation Criteria

req Theoretical development of hypotheses

Good

req Quality of design and methods

Good

req Adequate data analyses

Good

req Quality of discussion

Good

req Legitimacy of conclusions

Marginal

req Clarity and readability

Good

req Use of references

Good

req Rationale and clarity of definition

Good

req Writing style

Adequate

req Contributes to new knowledge in the field

Excellent

req Integration of theory (if applicable)

Good

Additional Questions

Please suggest one or more reviewers for future manuscripts submitted to SAGE Open on this topic (name, e-mail, affiliation).

Would you be willing to recommend a publication decision for this manuscript as an Article Editor?

Yes

No

Recommendation

Accept Pending Minor Revision

Would you be willing to review a revision of this manuscript?

Yes

Confidential Comments to the Editor

This is an interesting issue in the field of Islamic Management. It counts as an effort in measuring an abstract concept of Islamic piety.

Comments to the Author

1. References that support the issue is a bit old (10 years or more) as it can be observed in paragraph 1
2. The first sentence on page 1 line 36 claimed "the lack of agreement of...", but it is from the references of 2003 and 2010. It is possible that between 2010 - present, there has been an agreement. Author/s need to find more convincing arguments to this standing.
3. Page 3, line 12 -13, instead of arguing by presenting old data, the author should show the lack of findings from previous literature that aim at building a model for measuring Islamic piety in combination with ANN
4. I suggest separating the discussion from the conclusion, it easier to read that way
5. In the last part of section 5, the study should add an implication to the findings

Files attached

Do you want to get recognition for this review on Publons?

Yes



Azharsyah Ibrahim <azharsyah@ar-raniry.ac.id>

Invitation to Review for SAGE Open (IF 0.715), Manuscript ID SO-20-1747

2 messages

SAGE Open <onbehalf@manuscriptcentral.com>
Reply-To: avanti.dhiman@sagepub.in
To: azharsyah@ar-raniry.ac.id

Wed, Jul 15, 2020 at 3:24 PM

15-Jul-2020

Dear Dr. Ibrahim:

We have recently received Manuscript ID SO-20-1747 entitled "Hybrid Modelling of Islamic Piety Via Exploratory Factor Analysis and An Artificial Neural Network" and, based on your area of expertise, would like to invite you to review this manuscript. The abstract appears at the end of this letter.

SAGE Open (IF 0.715) is an open access, peer-reviewed journal indexed in Sciences Citation Index (SSCI), DOAJ (Directory of Open Access Journals), and Scopus which focuses on Humanities, Social Sciences, and Behavioral Sciences.

Please let me know as soon as possible if you will be able to accept my invitation to review. If you are unable to review at this time, I would appreciate you recommending another expert reviewer. You may e-mail me with your reply or click the appropriate link at the bottom of the page to automatically register your reply with our online manuscript submission and review system.

We realize you must have a number of personal and professional priorities at the moment, given the global situation around COVID-19. If you are not able to review at this time or you need additional time to complete this review, please let us know. Your safety and that of your family is our priority during these difficult times.

SAGE Open is committed to ensuring that the peer-review process is as robust and ethical as possible. The Committee on Publication Ethics (COPE) guidelines regarding peer review can be found at the following link. Please read the guidelines before accepting or declining my invitation. http://publicationethics.org/files/Ethical_guidelines_for_peer_reviewers_0.pdf.

SAGE Open greatly values the work of our reviewers. In recognition of your support, we are pleased to offer you free access to all SAGE journals for 60 days upon receipt of your completed review and a 25% book discount on all SAGE books ordered online. We will send you details of how to register for online access and order books at discount as soon as you have submitted your review.

As part of a six month pilot program, our reviewers now have the opportunity to opt-in to receive credit for their review contributions at Publons.com. You can read more about opting in and how this benefits you here: <https://publons.com/in/sage/>

Once you accept my invitation to review this manuscript, you will be notified via e-mail about how to access Manuscript Central, our online manuscript submission and review system. You will then have access to the manuscript and reviewer instructions in your Reviewer Center.

I realize that our expert reviewers greatly contribute to the high standards of the Journal, and I thank you for your present and/or future participation.

Sincerely,
Ms. Avanti Dhiman
avanti.dhiman@sagepub.in

*** PLEASE NOTE: This is a two-step process. After clicking on the link, you will be directed to a webpage to confirm.

Agreed: https://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/sageopen?URL_MASK=79b7f7f858724326b833804906f09b63

Declined: Abstract indicates poor study quality: https://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/sageopen?URL_MASK=0ed6b42bb7ee400a8266a2a1088e2e9b

Declined: Abstract indicates poor language quality: https://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/sageopen?URL_MASK=

[8fb04fcef2e1468ebf49534456cda044](https://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/sageopen?URL_MASK=8fb04fcef2e1468ebf49534456cda044)

Declined: Not my field : https://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/sageopen?URL_MASK=86f2945b99494742a2a699104d562ee3

Declined: Don't have time: https://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/sageopen?URL_MASK=c348c7c5553448e6a6f241cf4b15e27b

MANUSCRIPT DETAILS

TITLE: Hybrid Modelling of Islamic Piety Via Exploratory Factor Analysis and An Artificial Neural Network

ABSTRACT: The purpose of the study is to investigate a hybrid model of Islamic piety, by merging exploratory factor analysis (EFA) and an artificial neural network (ANN). The present research was divided into three phases. The first phase applied the Delphi method to identify the dimensions of Islamic piety. In the second, the dimensions established using the Delphi method were used in exploratory factor analysis (EFA) to uncover the underlying structure of Islamic Piety construct. In the last phase, an artificial neural network (ANN) was used to rank the factors discovered to establish their significance. The EFA results offers a new model of Islamic Piety comprising of five factors: Rituals, Belief, integrity, love of family and justice. An ANN model was formed and enhanced using the determination of model variables. The results revealed that the main variables in the Islamic piety are Rituals, integrity, belief, love of family and justice. The implication of this study is useful for educational, academic, organizational management including leadership, training and human development, and policy making initiatives. Management can use the model developed to satisfy the needs of their employees and hence enhance to increase the productivity. This study is one of the pioneering studies in the field of Islamic management and the first to employ ANN. The results of the present research affirm that Islamic Piety is one of the key fundamentals of Islamic faith.

Azharsyah Ibrahim <azharsyah@ar-raniry.ac.id>
To: avanti.dhiman@sagepub.in

Thu, Jul 16, 2020 at 7:05 AM

Dear Ms. Dhiman:

Thank you for thinking of me. Basically, I agree to review but might need additional time due to my workload in July.

Thank you

[Quoted text hidden]

--

Dr. Azharsyah Ibrahim, SE. Ak, M.S.O.M
Associate Professor in Islamic Management
Deputy Head, Internal Control Division
Editor in Chief, Share; Jurnal Ekonomi dan Keuangan Islam
Ar-Raniry State Islamic University
Banda Aceh, 23111
<https://jurnal.ar-raniry.ac.id/index.php/Share>



Azharsyah Ibrahim <azharsyah@ar-raniry.ac.id>

Manuscript ID SO-20-1747 now in your Reviewer Center - SAGE Open

1 message

SAGE Open <onbehalf@manuscriptcentral.com>

Thu, Jul 16, 2020 at 6:58 AM

Reply-To: sageopen@sagepub.com

To: azharsyah@ar-raniry.ac.id

15-Jul-2020

Dear Dr. Ibrahim:

Thank you for agreeing to review Manuscript ID SO-20-1747 entitled "Hybrid Modelling of Islamic Piety Via Exploratory Factor Analysis and An Artificial Neural Network" for SAGE Open. The due date for the review is 25-Jul-2020. Please try your best to complete your review in a timely manner, but if you need an extension feel free to contact the editorial office by replying to this message.

We realize you must have a number of personal and professional priorities at the moment, given the global situation around COVID-19. If you are not able to serve in this role for us at this time or you need additional time to complete this review, please let us know. Your safety and that of your family is our priority during these difficult times.

Please note that SAGE Open evaluates the scientific and research methods of each article for validity and accepts articles solely on the basis of the research. You will be asked to rate the quality of the manuscript's research methodology according to basic criteria; because these criteria capture the intent of the peer review process, your narrative review comments need be only a few brief paragraphs in length, summarizing your main reactions to the paper and noting the key issues.

In your review, please answer all questions. On the review page, there is a space for "Comments to Editor" and a space for "Comments to the Author." Please be sure to put your comments to the author in the appropriate space.

You may access the manuscript and the reviewer rating form directly by clicking the following link:

https://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/sageopen?URL_MASK=8658b9d727fa4445b681f5409ec94d93

Or, you may login to SAGE Open - ScholarOne Manuscripts site at <https://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/sageopen>. Your case-sensitive USER ID is azharsyah@ar-raniry.ac.id. For security purposes your password is not listed in this email. If you are unsure of your password you may click the link below to set a new password.

https://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/sageopen?URL_MASK=2a565d94afab4e9bb754edb393ea66ec

Once you are logged in, the Home Page will be displayed. Please click on the Review link at the top of the page. You will find the manuscript listed under "Review and Score". The Action drop down will list all actions available to you. We recommend that you start by selecting "Continue Review", as this will present all available options. You will be able to view the manuscript proof, read the reviewer guidelines, and access all files for review associated with the manuscript.

Follow the instructions for reviewers provided in the ScholarOne Manuscripts site. We strongly encourage you to elaborate on your review in the space provided. Your specific comments will offer valuable feedback to improve future work.

Please click the "Save as Draft" button at the bottom of the review form if you wish to exit the review before you submit it to the Editor to ensure that all work is saved.

When you have completed your review and are ready to submit it to the Editor, click on "Submit Review."

After completing your review you will be given the opportunity to get credit for your review at Publons.com. You can read more about opting in and how this benefits you here: <https://publons.com/in/sage/>

All communications regarding this manuscript are privileged. Any conflict of interest, suspicion of duplicate publication, fabrication of data or plagiarism must immediately be reported to me.

Thank you for evaluating this manuscript.

Sincerely,
Editorial Office SAGE Open
SAGE Open Editorial Office



Azharsyah Ibrahim <azharsyah@ar-raniry.ac.id>

Reminder: SAGE Open

2 messages

SAGE Open <onbehalf@manuscriptcentral.com>
Reply-To: sageopen@sagepub.com
To: azharsyah@ar-raniry.ac.id

Wed, Jul 22, 2020 at 8:00 PM

22-Jul-2020

Dear Dr. Ibrahim:

Recently, you agreed to review Manuscript ID SO-20-1747, entitled "Hybrid Modelling of Islamic Piety Via Exploratory Factor Analysis and An Artificial Neural Network." The manuscript is located in your Reviewer Center at <https://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/sageopen> .

This e-mail is simply a reminder that your review is due in three days. You may access the manuscript and the reviewer form directly by clicking the following link:

https://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/sageopen?URL_MASK=80f9a91cef58439f8de7434d67ffa6a6

I realize you must have a number of personal and professional priorities at the moment, given the global situation around COVID-19. If you are not able to review for us at this time or you need additional time to complete this review, please let me know. Your safety and that of your family is our priority during these difficult times.

I appreciate your help in accomplishing our goal of having an expedited reviewing process. Please do not hesitate to contact the editorial office for assistance.

Sincerely,
Editorial Office SAGE Open
SAGE Open Editorial Office

Azharsyah Ibrahim <azharsyah@ar-raniry.ac.id>
To: sageopen@sagepub.com

Thu, Jul 23, 2020 at 5:53 AM

Basically, I agree to review but will need additional time due to my high workload in July. If I may, I would to request the deadline extension until 30 July 2020. Thank you

[Quoted text hidden]



Azharsyah Ibrahim <azharsyah@ar-raniry.ac.id>

Reminder: Review Due Today - SAGE Open

1 message

SAGE Open <onbehalf@manuscriptcentral.com>
Reply-To: sageopen@sagepub.com
To: azharsyah@ar-raniry.ac.id

Sun, Jul 26, 2020 at 2:16 PM

26-Jul-2020

Dear Dr. Ibrahim:

Recently, you agreed to review Manuscript ID SO-20-1747, entitled "Hybrid Modelling of Islamic Piety Via Exploratory Factor Analysis and An Artificial Neural Network." This e-mail is a reminder that your review is now due. Please complete and submit your review via ScholarOne Manuscripts - <https://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/sageopen> . You may also access the manuscript and the reviewer form directly by clicking the following link:

https://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/sageopen?URL_MASK=72d335e4a8c44ce48a80453fe8922fef

I realize you must have a number of personal and professional priorities at the moment, given the global situation around coronavirus. If you are not able to review for us at this time or you need additional time to complete this review, please let me know. Your safety and that of your family is our priority during these difficult times.

Do not hesitate to contact me if I can be of any assistance.

Sincerely,
Editorial Office SAGE Open
SAGE Open Editorial Office



Azharsyah Ibrahim <azharsyah@ar-raniry.ac.id>

Thank you for submitting your review of Manuscript ID SO-20-1747 for SAGE Open

2 messages

SAGE Open <onbehalf@manuscriptcentral.com>
Reply-To: sageopen@sagepub.com
To: azharsyah@ar-raniry.ac.id

Sun, Jul 26, 2020 at 8:23 PM

26-Jul-2020

Dear Dr. Ibrahim:

Thank you for reviewing manuscript # SO-20-1747 entitled "Hybrid Modelling of Islamic Piety Via Exploratory Factor Analysis and An Artificial Neural Network" for SAGE Open.

In recognition of your support, SAGE Open is pleased to offer you 60 days complimentary online access to all journals published by SAGE. Register at <http://journals.sagepub.com/page/help/reviewer-access> to activate access to content from all journals. To also benefit from a 25% discount on all SAGE books ordered online, go to the SAGE website (<http://www.sagepublications.com/>) and add the SAGE books that you would like to purchase to your shopping cart. When checking out, enter the Promotion Code GL10JR0001 when prompted. This will automatically deduct 25% from your final bill.

If you opted to receive credit for your review at Publons.com, you will shortly receive an email with a private link to claim your review. You can read more about this service and how this benefits you here: <https://publons.com/in/sage/>

On behalf of the Editors of SAGE Open, we appreciate the voluntary contribution that each reviewer gives to the Journal. We thank you for your participation in the online review process and hope that we may call upon you again to review future manuscripts.

Sincerely,
SAGE Open Editorial Office
sageopen@sagepub.com

Azharsyah Ibrahim <azharsyah@ar-raniry.ac.id>
To: reviews@publons.com

Sun, Jul 26, 2020 at 9:46 PM

[Quoted text hidden]