

---

**A manuscript number has been assigned to Application of HEC-HMS Model (Hydrologic Engineering Center-Hydrology Modelling System) in Indonesia: Reviews, Challenges and Prospects - [EMID:3068c75c4cd3ec07]**

1 message

---

**EASR** <em@editorialmanager.com>

Wed, Mar 16, 2022 at 1:26 PM

Reply-To: EASR <kku.enjournal@gmail.com>

To: "M. Faisi Ikhwalı" <faisi.ikhwalı@ar-raniry.ac.id>

CC: "Chalermchai Pawattana" [chapaw@kku.ac.th](mailto:chapaw@kku.ac.th), "Suardi Nur" [suardinur.fst@ar-raniry.ac.id](mailto:suardinur.fst@ar-raniry.ac.id), "Budi Azhari" [budiazhari@ar-raniry.ac.id](mailto:budiazhari@ar-raniry.ac.id), "Muhammad Ikhsan" [m.ikhsan@utu.ac.id](mailto:m.ikhsan@utu.ac.id), "Nur Aida" [nur.aida@ar-raniry.ac.id](mailto:nur.aida@ar-raniry.ac.id), "Cut Suciatina Silvia" [coetsilvia@utu.ac.id](mailto:coetsilvia@utu.ac.id)

Dear Mr. Ikhwalı,

Your submission entitled "Application of HEC-HMS Model (Hydrologic Engineering Center-Hydrology Modelling System) in Indonesia: Reviews, Challenges and Prospects" has been assigned the following manuscript number: EASR-D-22-00011.

You will be able to check on the progress of your paper by logging on to Editorial Manager as an author. The URL is <https://www.editorialmanager.com/easr/>.

Thank you for submitting your work to this journal.

Kind regards,

EASR Engineering and Applied Science Research  
Chief Editor  
Engineering and Applied Science Research

---

In compliance with data protection regulations, you may request that we remove your personal registration details at any time. (Use the following URL: <https://www.editorialmanager.com/easr/login.asp?a=r>). Please contact the publication office if you have any questions.

---

## Your Submission - [EMID:880b8b01dd46504f]

2 messages

EASR <em@editorialmanager.com>

Fri, Apr 8, 2022 at 4:19 PM

Reply-To: EASR <kku.enjournal@gmail.com>

To: "M. Faisi Ikhwalı" <faisi.ikhwalı@ar-raniry.ac.id>

Ref.: Ms. No. EASR-D-22-00011

Article Title: **"Application of HEC-HMS Model (Hydrologic Engineering Center-Hydrology Modelling System) in Indonesia: Reviews, Challenges and Prospects"**

Engineering and Applied Science Research

Dear Mr. Ikhwalı,

Reviewers have now commented on your paper. You will see that they are advising that you revise your manuscript. If you are prepared to undertake the work required, I would be pleased to reconsider my decision.

For your guidance, reviewers' comments are appended below.

If you decide to revise the work, please submit a list of changes or a rebuttal against each point which is being raised when you submit the revised manuscript.

Your revision is due by **2022-04-30 23:59:59**.

Our decision is to: Major Revisions Required

If your paper is revised, please kindly send 1. Full revised manuscript with highlight 2. Blind revised manuscript with highlight and 3. Paper revising form.

\*\*\*\* NOTE \*\*\*\* The revision of the article, **please highlight the text has changed (Use different colors for each reviewer)**.

To submit a revision, go to <https://www.editorialmanager.com/easr/> and log in as an Author. You will see a menu item call Submission Needing Revision. You will find your submission record there.

Yours sincerely

Sujin Bureerat  
Editor  
Engineering and Applied Science Research

### Comments from the Editor and Reviewers :

Reviewer 1:

Manuscript Number: EASR-D-22-00011

Title: Application of HEC-HMS Model (Hydrologic Engineering Center-Hydrology Modelling System) in Indonesia: Reviews, Challenges and Prospects

The manuscript presents "Application of HEC-HMS Model (Hydrologic Engineering Center-Hydrology Modelling System) in Indonesia: Reviews, Challenges and Prospects" which is interesting. However, the manuscript, in its present form, contains several weaknesses. Appropriate revisions to the following points should be undertaken in order to justify recommendation for publication.

For readers to quickly catch your contribution, it would be better to highlight major difficulties and challenges, and your original achievements to overcome them, in a clearer way in abstract and introduction.

**Abstract**

The abstract is relatively appropriate and good.

**Introduction**

In Introduction section:

Introduction is very low and unacceptable.

The purpose of the research is unclear. Also, there is no high coherence to express the research approach. Review of Literature is relatively weak and old. At least 50% of the sources should be from the last 3-4 years of reputable journals.

Full names should be shown for all abbreviations in their first occurrence in texts. For example, HEC-HMS, HEC-IFH and PRECIP in p.2, etc.

Material and Methods

Figs 1 and 3 have low quality.

Results

Where do the results start?

Write the result and discussion separately.

Discussion

The discussion section in the present form is relatively weak and should be strengthened with more details and justifications.

After making revisions in the introduction section, revisions should be applied in this section as well.

Moreover, the manuscript could be substantially improved by relying and citing more on recent literatures about HEC-HMS Model such as the followings:

Gholami, et al. (2020). A simulation of the rainfall-runoff process using artificial neural network and HEC-HMS model in forest lands. *Journal of Forest Science*, 67: 165-174. <https://doi.org/10.17221/90/2020-JFS>

Hashemyan et al. (2015). Combination of HEC-HMS and HEC-RAS models in GIS in order to Simulate Flood (Case study: Khoshke Rudan river in Fars province, Iran). *Research Journal of Recent Sciences*, 4(8), 122-127.

Khaleghi, et al. (2018). Simulation of relationship between river discharge and sediment yield in the semi-arid river watersheds. *Acta Geophysica*, 66(1), 109-119.

Farajzadeh, et al. (2020). Evaluation of the efficiency of the rainfall simulator to achieve a regional model of erosion (Case study: Toroq watershed in the east north of Iran). *Acta Geophysica*, 68(5): 1477-1488. DOI: 10.1007/s11600-020-00487-0

In the conclusion section, the limitations of this study, suggested improvements of this work and future directions should be highlighted. What is the research innovation(s)?

Reviewer 2:

The manuscript is just a compilation of manuscripts of application of HEC-HMS in Indonesia. The authors only separated the manuscripts by year, region and basin size.

I do not recommend the manuscript to be published in an international audience journal. However, the authors can publish it into Indonesia's journals.

Some minor points:

The authors reference the cited literature as recommended by the Journal. In lines 32-33 the form "(HEC, 1989)" is used. In the rest of the manuscript the form "[1,2]" is used.

Section "2. HEC-HMS overview" is not properly an overview of the model. It seems to be part of the manuscript's Introduction. So, I suggest moving the section's texts to the Introduction section.

Line 93: "11°08'LS" is not correct, but "11°08'S"

Line 102: What does BMKG mean?

Line 105: What does BPS mean?

Please improve the resolution of Figure 1. I can hardly see the Indonesia limits. Move the Figure to line 121, after the its 1st citation.

Don't divide Section 4 in subsections.

Lines 216-218: "ha" not "Ha".

Figure 4: What does NP and MP mean?

Line 228: Delete the word "below".

Reviewer 3:

Dear authors,

The authors have not attempted to critically review the previous applications of the HEC-HMS applications in the Indonesian context. The authors have not discussed the strength and weaknesses of the previous applications deeply. I see this as a rather shallow approach. The English, grammar and typo mistakes should also be corrected significantly during this stage.

It is not sufficient only to cite a previous work. You have not discussed the previous applications critically. The discussion is not solid. I advise you to refer to several well-written review papers (no need to be limited to HEC-HMS).

However, I still believe that this work can be improved significantly. My comments will definitely help you. A good start. According to my judgements major revisions are required. (See attachment file)

Good luck  
Wish you success

---

There is additional documentation related to this decision letter. To access the file(s), please click the link below. You may also login to the system and click the 'View Attachments' link in the Action column.  
[View Attachments](#)

---

---

*In compliance with data protection regulations, you may request that we remove your personal registration details at any time. ([Remove my information/details](#)). Please contact the publication office if you have any questions.*

---

#### 2 attachments



**PAPER REVISING FORM (First review).doc**  
45K



**Comment reviewer 3.pdf**  
795K

---

**M. Faisi Ikhwal** <faisi.ikhwal@ar-raniry.ac.id>  
To: Suardi Nur <suardinur.fst@ar-raniry.ac.id>

Sat, Apr 9, 2022 at 3:42 PM

[Quoted text hidden]

---

#### 2 attachments



**PAPER REVISING FORM (First review).doc**  
45K



**Comment reviewer 3.pdf**  
795K

---

## Your Submission - [EMID:6454b27494bc3bad]

1 message

---

**EASR** <em@editorialmanager.com>  
Reply-To: EASR <kku.enjournal@gmail.com>  
To: "M. Faisi Ikhwalı" <faisi.ikhwalı@ar-raniry.ac.id>

Tue, May 17, 2022 at 1:27 PM

Ref.: Ms. No. EASR-D-22-00011R1

Article Title: **"Reviews, Challenges and Prospects of the application of Hydrologic Engineering Center-Hydrology Modelling System (HEC-HMS) Model in Indonesia"**

Engineering and Applied Science Research

Dear Mr. Ikhwalı,

Reviewers have now commented on your paper. You will see that they are advising that you revise your manuscript. If you are prepared to undertake the work required, I would be pleased to reconsider my decision.

For your guidance, reviewers' comments are appended below.

If you decide to revise the work, please submit a list of changes or a rebuttal against each point which is being raised when you submit the revised manuscript.

Your revision is due by **2022-05-31 23:59:59**.

Our decision is to: Major Revisions Required

If your paper is revised, please kindly send 1. Full revised manuscript with highlight 2. Blind revised manuscript with highlight 3. Paper revising form 4. Certificate proofreading and 5. Full revised manuscript (with track changes for proofread).

\*\*\*\* NOTE \*\*\*\* The revision of the article, **please highlight the text has changed**.

To submit a revision, go to <https://www.editorialmanager.com/easr/> and log in as an Author. You will see a menu item call Submission Needing Revision. You will find your submission record there.

Yours sincerely

Sujin Bureerat  
Editor  
Engineering and Applied Science Research

### Comments from the Editor and Reviewers :

Reviewer 3:

Dear authors,

I am happy to see that the paper has improved significantly. However, there is still more space for improvement. I have provided my comments and feedbacks through "comments" option. I have also used a "LIGHT YELLOW" color to highlight the mistakes. The improvements are mostly required in grammar, formatting. Since there were multiple mistakes I recommend a "major revision". Another suggestion for improvement is to use the services of a native English speaker to revise the manuscript in terms of English and grammar. If these are taken into consideration I hope that the paper can be accepted for EASR. (see the attachment file)

Thanks

---

There is additional documentation related to this decision letter. To access the file(s), please click the link below. You may also login to the system and click the 'View Attachments' link in the Action column.

[View Attachments](#)

---

---

*In compliance with data protection regulations, you may request that we remove your personal registration details at any time. ([Remove my information/details](#)). Please contact the publication office if you have any questions.*

---

## 2 attachments



**PAPER REVISING FORM (Second review).doc**

40K



**Comment reviewer 3 round 2.pdf**

1496K

---

## Submission Confirmation for EASR-D-22-00011R2 - [EMID:c99f9aa3151e38d1]

1 message

---

**EASR** <em@editorialmanager.com>  
Reply-To: EASR <kku.enjournal@gmail.com>  
To: "M. Faisi Ikhwalı" <faisi.ikhwalı@ar-raniry.ac.id>

Tue, May 24, 2022 at 7:02 PM

Ref.: Ms. No. EASR-D-22-00011R2

Reviews, Challenges and Prospects of the application of Hydrologic Engineering Center - Hydrologic Modelling System (HEC-HMS) Model in Indonesia

Dear Mr. Ikhwalı,

Engineering and Applied Science Research has received your revised submission.

You may check the status of your manuscript by logging onto Editorial Manager at (<https://www.editorialmanager.com/easr/>).

Kind regards,

---

In compliance with data protection regulations, you may request that we remove your personal registration details at any time. (Use the following URL: <https://www.editorialmanager.com/easr/login.asp?a=r>). Please contact the publication office if you have any questions.

---

## Your Submission - [EMID:cd244da6560e5a2d]

1 message

---

EASR <em@editorialmanager.com>

Wed, Jun 1, 2022 at 1:50 PM

Reply-To: EASR <kku.enjournal@gmail.com>

To: "M. Faisi Ikhwalı" <faisi.ikhwalı@ar-raniry.ac.id>

Ref.: Ms. No. EASR-D-22-00011R2

Article Title: **"Reviews, Challenges and Prospects of the application of Hydrologic Engineering Center - Hydrologic Modelling System (HEC-HMS) Model in Indonesia"**

Engineering and Applied Science Research

Dear Mr. Ikhwalı,

Reviewers have now commented on your paper. You will see that they are advising that you revise your manuscript. If you are prepared to undertake the work required, I would be pleased to reconsider my decision.

For your guidance, reviewers' comments are appended below.

If you decide to revise the work, please submit a list of changes or a rebuttal against each point which is being raised when you submit the revised manuscript.

Your revision is due by **2022-06-15 23:59:59**.

Our decision is to: Major Revisions Required

If your paper is revised, please kindly send 1. Full revised manuscript with highlight 2. Blind revised manuscript with highlight and 3. Paper revising form.

\*\*\*\* NOTE \*\*\*\* The revision of the article, **please highlight the text has changed**.

To submit a revision, go to <https://www.editorialmanager.com/easr/> and log in as an Author. You will see a menu item call Submission Needing Revision. You will find your submission record there.

Yours sincerely

Sujin Bureerat

Editor

Engineering and Applied Science Research

### Comments from the Editor and Reviewers :

Reviewer 3:

Dear authors,

You have worked hard to improve the paper further after Revision stage 1. However, I still recommend a major revision. Still there grammar mistakes in mutiple places. I have pointed out all places where corrections are required. These are shown in "comments" option and also in "YELLOW" color.

Please take some time to correct these. If these are corrected in the next version I can provide a recommendation for the chief editor to accept this paper.

Best of luck.

---

There is additional documentation related to this decision letter. To access the file(s), please click the link below. You may



also login to the system and click the 'View Attachments' link in the Action column.  
[View Attachments](#)

---

---

*In compliance with data protection regulations, you may request that we remove your personal registration details at any time. ([Remove my information/details](#)). Please contact the publication office if you have any questions.*

---

**2 attachments**

 **PAPER REVISING FORM (Third review).doc**  
40K

 **Comment reviewer 3 round 3.pdf**  
1486K

---

## Submission Confirmation for EASR-D-22-00011R3 - [EMID:94597cbb37d450f1]

1 message

---

**EASR** <em@editorialmanager.com>

Tue, Jun 7, 2022 at 1:44 PM

Reply-To: EASR <kku.enjournal@gmail.com>

To: "M. Faisi Ikhwalı" <faisi.ikhwalı@ar-raniry.ac.id>

Ref.: Ms. No. EASR-D-22-00011R3

Reviews, Challenges, and Prospects of the application of Hydrologic Engineering Center - Hydrologic Modelling System (HEC-HMS) Model in Indonesia

Dear Mr. Ikhwalı,

Engineering and Applied Science Research has received your revised submission.

You may check the status of your manuscript by logging onto Editorial Manager at (<https://www.editorialmanager.com/easr/>).

Kind regards,

---

In compliance with data protection regulations, you may request that we remove your personal registration details at any time. (Use the following URL: <https://www.editorialmanager.com/easr/login.asp?a=r>). Please contact the publication office if you have any questions.

---

## Your Submission - [EMID:56dd3039f6ad23af]

1 message

---

**EASR** <em@editorialmanager.com>

Mon, Jun 20, 2022 at 9:56 AM

Reply-To: EASR <kku.enjournal@gmail.com>

To: "M. Faisi Ikhwalı" <faisi.ikhwalı@ar-raniry.ac.id>

Ref.: Ms. No. EASR-D-22-00011R3

Reviews, Challenges, and Prospects of the application of Hydrologic Engineering Center - Hydrologic Modelling System (HEC-HMS) Model in Indonesia  
Engineering and Applied Science Research

Dear authors,

We have reached a decision regarding your submission to Engineering and Applied Science Research, "Reviews, Challenges, and Prospects of the application of Hydrologic Engineering Center - Hydrologic Modelling System (HEC-HMS) Model in Indonesia".

Our decision is to: The paper can be accepted for publication in Engineering and Applied Science Research.

The acceptance date of your paper is June 20, 2022.

Thank you for submitting your work to Engineering and Applied Science Research.

Yours sincerely,  
Editorial Office  
Engineering and Applied Science Research  
Faculty of Engineering,  
Khon Kaen University, 40002 Thailand  
[kku.enjournal@gmail.com](mailto:kku.enjournal@gmail.com)

---

In compliance with data protection regulations, you may request that we remove your personal registration details at any time. (Use the following URL: <https://www.editorialmanager.com/easr/login.asp?a=r>). Please contact the publication office if you have any questions.

---

## [EASR] Please check your articles before published

5 messages

---

**Enjournal Kku** <kku.enjournal@gmail.com>  
To: "M. Faisi Ikhwalı" <faisi.ikhwalı@ar-raniry.ac.id>

Fri, Jul 22, 2022 at 2:09 PM

Dear Author,


Your accepted manuscript entitled "**Reviews, Challenges, and prospects of the application of Hydrologic Engineering Center-Hydrologic Modelling System (HEC-HMS) model in Indonesia**" will be published in Engineering and Applied Science Research, **In progress: Vol. 49, No.5, year 2022**. The format of your manuscript has been adjusted according to the journal's specific formatting (new format). Please check your articles before publishing.

If you have any corrections, please highlight and comment in the PDF file.

Please return the final version of your manuscript by **July 25, 2022**.

Best Regards,  
Editorial Team  
Engineering and Applied Science Research  
Faculty of Engineering,  
Khon Kaen University, 40002 Thailand  
[kku.enjournal@gmail.com](mailto:kku.enjournal@gmail.com)

---

 **5-101-22.pdf**  
695K


---

**M. Faisi Ikhwalı** <faisi.ikhwalı@ar-raniry.ac.id>  
To: Suardi Nur <suardinur.fst@ar-raniry.ac.id>

Fri, Jul 22, 2022 at 5:08 PM

[Quoted text hidden]

---

 **5-101-22.pdf**  
695K

---

**M. Faisi Ikhwalı** <faisi.ikhwalı@ar-raniry.ac.id>  
To: Enjournal Kku <kku.enjournal@gmail.com>

Sun, Jul 24, 2022 at 1:03 PM

Dear Editor (s) of EASR Journal

We have re-read and checked the whole manuscript that you have sent us.

Hereby we attached the manuscript that is given comment for change,

the change will be...

1. the affiliation list
2. Title
3. In references list and reference number

Best Regard

[Quoted text hidden]

---



**5-101-22 Checked.pdf**

1167K

---

**Enjournal Kku** <kku.enjournal@gmail.com>  
To: "M. Faisi Ikhwali" <faisi.ikhwali@ar-raniry.ac.id>

Mon, Jul 25, 2022 at 9:36 AM

Dear Author,

Please check your articles again before publishing.

If you have any corrections, please let us know within **July 25, 2022**.

Best Regards,  
Editorial Team  
Engineering and Applied Science Research  
Faculty of Engineering,  
Khon Kaen University, 40002 Thailand  
[kku.enjournal@gmail.com](mailto:kku.enjournal@gmail.com)

[Quoted text hidden]



**5-101-22.pdf**

598K

---

**M. Faisi Ikhwali** <faisi.ikhwali@ar-raniry.ac.id>  
To: Enjournal Kku <kku.enjournal@gmail.com>

Mon, Jul 25, 2022 at 11:41 AM

Dear Editor (s)

We have re-read and checked our latest manuscript (as you attached in previous email),  
and we confirm that there is no change anymore.

Thankyou very much for publishing our manuscript

Best regards

[Quoted text hidden]